Briefing Note: Teacher Supply Initiatives Update

To: Hon Chris Hipkins, Minister of Education

Date: 19 February 2019  Priority: Low

Security Level: Ir. Confidence  METIS No: 1176661

Drafter: Traci Linders  DDI: s 9(2)(a)

Key Contact: John McKeefry  DDI:

Messaging seen by Communications team: No  Round Robin: No

Purpose of Report

This report provides a detailed update of the progress and impact of the Teacher Supply initiatives, introduced as part of the December 2017 Teacher Supply package [CAB-17-MIN0535], continued through Budget 2018 and expanded in October 2018.

The purpose of this paper is for you to:

- **Note** the progress and impact of the Teacher Supply initiatives.
- **Agree** that this briefing will be proactively released withholding any material related to the 2019 Budget, which will be proactively released as part of the budget process.

Summary

- This report provides you with detailed information on the progress and impact of the Teacher Supply Initiatives which the Government introduced in December 2017, continued through Budget 2018 and expanded in October 2018 to increase Teacher Supply.
- We have actively promoted Teacher Supply initiatives, which has contributed to their success.
- We have also conducted two surveys to confirm if our initiatives are working as expected:
  - In November 2018 we undertook a survey of Teacher Education Refresh (TER) programme participants to understand if this has resulted in more teachers in the classroom.
In January 2019 we undertook a survey of schools to gain insights into the number vacancies across the country.

- The findings of these surveys have informed this report.
Background

1. There have been three separate investments in Teacher Supply, totalling $40 million, since December 2017. The most recent investment of October 2018, following on from Budget 2018, introduced an expanded set of initiatives to increase Teacher Supply to support schools to fill vacancies for the 2019 school year. This investment followed the projections of the new Teacher Supply Demand and Supply Planning Tool (the tool).

2. In simple terms, the tool calculates the number of teachers we expect to need in the future (demand) and compares this to the number of teachers we expect to have in the future (supply). It estimates these by looking at trends in our data – such as in the number of students in our schools and how many teachers are entering and exiting the workforce – and makes assumptions on how these trends will continue into the future.

3. Teacher demand and supply are both complex to predict. Demand for teachers is mainly driven by the number of teachers required to meet teacher-student staffing ratios, as well as individual employment decisions by schools to staff above these ratios. Likewise, supply is driven by a complex mix of economic conditions and individual employment decisions by current and prospective teachers.

4. The results from the initial iteration of the tool indicated that the supply of primary school teachers nationally would be 650 lower than the demand for primary teachers during the 2019 school year. This is equal to 1.9 percent of demand not being met. For secondary school teachers, the supply would be 170 lower than the demand in 2019. This is equal to 0.6 per cent of demand not being met.

5. The projected level of supply in 2019, prior to the introduction of the expanded set of Teacher Supply initiatives, was sufficient to meet the projected demand for teachers from staffing entitlement (that is, to meet the required teacher-student ratios), but it was insufficient to meet the estimated level of demand for employing teachers above entitlement. It is important to note that the tool provides projections for primary and secondary teachers, at a national level and for Auckland. However, it does not provide projections at a more granular level, for example: it does not tell us if we need a mathematics teacher in Auckland Region.

6. The October 2018 investment expanded the provision of some existing initiatives and introduced new initiatives. This included increasing the number of overseas-trained teachers being recruited through the targeted recruitment campaign and introducing a National Beginning Teacher Induction Grant to increase the number of new graduates in New Zealand being offered roles.

7. The table below shows how our current initiatives offset the tool projections for 2019.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Supply Planning Tool Projection</th>
<th>Total Number of Teachers</th>
<th>Estimated Increase to Supply Within Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROJECTED SUPPLY GAP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>650</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiative</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auckland Fund¹ Beginner Teacher Fund</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teach First</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Beginner Teacher</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overseas Teachers recruited</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>566</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projection Difference</td>
<td>(254)</td>
<td>(294)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ It should be noted that the Auckland Beginning Teacher Fund contributes to supply through retention and differs from the other initiatives in this table that contribute increased number of teachers.
8. We anticipate that the remaining projected difference in primary teachers (a difference of 294 for the remainder of the 2019 school year), will be addressed through additional overseas teacher recruitment along with the recruitment of New Zealand trained teachers.

9. There are enough screened overseas Primary teacher applicants for Principals to interview for roles they have currently lodged.

10. The impact of TER, changes the mix between part-time and full-time teachers, and New Zealanders who have returned home to teach without contacting our overseas recruiters, will also contribute to addressing the projected difference.

11. The planning tool projections will be revised in April 2019, to take into account more recent payroll data and development work to keep improving our projections. This will inform our view of whether the long-term supply-demand balance has improved, as well as help us to understand better, the impact that our Teacher Supply initiatives have had on our long-term supply projections.

Progress of initiatives

12. It is difficult to quantify the overall increase in teachers for any given initiative, as teachers or schools can take up more than one opportunity for support. For example: an overseas teacher can undertake a TER programme and be granted an Overseas Relocation Grant (ORG); likewise, a school can claim a finder’s fee for that same teacher.

Teach First NZ

13. This is an employment based Initial Teacher Education (ITE) programme that aims to provide secondary teachers in lower decile communities.

14. The Teacher Supply Package in December 2017 increased the places available for the start of the 2019 year to 80. The 2018 Budget provided funding for a further 80 participants that will start in classrooms in January 2020.

15. The recruitment round for cohort 2019 ended in November 2018 and 82 successful recruits started a summer intensive programme in December 2018.

16. Five participants withdrew after the summer intensive programme for various reasons, 75 have started in schools at the beginning of Term one 2019 and two are still looking for placements and will start as soon as these are arranged.

17. The 75 participants who have been placed are working in 44 schools across eight regions nationally. Of these 13 are for Te Reo Māori and 43 are for Science, Technology and Mathematics (STM).

18. Anecdotally, Teach First NZ have advised the demand for their programme is still very high and they assessed approximately 700 applicants for this cohort.

19. Teach First NZ are currently preparing for recruitment of cohort 2020 who are due to start their summer intensive in December 2019.

TeachNZ Scholarships

20. TeachNZ scholarships were introduced in 1998 to address an undersupply of teachers in New Zealand. The programme has been modified over the years with scholarships now targeted to support recruitment into specific areas of the sector such as STM and Te Reo Māori in secondary, Māori Medium primary and ECE, or specific population groups such as Kupe for Māori and Pacific High Achievers.
21. The programme is generally well received, although Te Reo Māori Scholarships and ECE Māori & Pacific Languages Scholarships have historically been undersubscribed. In order to understand why that has been the case, the scholarship programme underwent a review which was completed in May 2018.

22. The review recommended that the scholarship programme be changed to lift the value of the scholarships, and to make scholarships available for all sectors and all subjects. It also highlighted that there were issues around the scheduling of the scholarships, where opening and closing dates did not appear to align well to either the ITE provider or the applicant.

23. The review also suggested that the scholarships had not been promoted widely enough, and too few people knew they were available.

24. Funding to change the value or type of scholarships available is subject to budget decisions.

25. In order to address the scheduling recommendation, all scholarships will open for three rounds in future. For 2019, this is from September 2018 to June 2019. This change has already demonstrated an increased uptake with 175 scholarships awarded in round one. By comparison, the total number of scholarships awarded in 2018 in all rounds was 348. However, round one data indicates that we have the same pattern of uptake as we have had historically in relation to the undersubscribed scholarships.

26. To lift the number of applications ahead of round two, we have implemented targeted social media and community campaigns to reach Māori and Pacific groups. This includes attendance at Te Matatini in February 2019 and Polyfest in March 2019, to promote the teaching profession and the support available to the Māori and Pacific communities.

Recruitment, Retention and Responsibility National Fund (3R)

27. The 3R national fund is not gaining traction with principals, despite the change to the policy settings in September 2018 to make it more accessible.

28. We have been actively targeting principals to make them aware of the change, however uptake has remained low and we have not seen any significant increase in the number of applications.

29. Since the fund opened on 30 January 2018, we have approved eight grants apportioned across five schools in the Auckland, Bay of Plenty and Southland regions.

30. These teachers with a Limited Authority to Teach are teaching the following subjects:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>APPLICATIONS</th>
<th>LAT SUBJECT</th>
<th>NUMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Auckland</td>
<td>Maths</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Te Reo Māori</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bay of Plenty/Waikato</td>
<td>Guidance Councillor</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southland</td>
<td>Learning Support and Disability</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Catering &amp; Hospitality</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8

31. Due to the low uptake of the fund, we will review this initiative further to look at alternative ways to better support increasing Teacher Supply. We will provide you with advice related to this in March 2019.
National Beginning Teacher Fund (NBT)

32. This initiative supports an increased number of beginning teachers into their first role. It provides financial assistance to schools for inducting, training or mentoring a beginning teacher, before they take on their own classes.

33. Applications for the grant were taken in November 2019 and 289 applications were received for the 230 grants available. This grant was over-subscribed as some schools applied for more than one grant.

34. As at 23 January 2019, we have allocated 155 grants to primary and 75 grants to secondary schools. Some schools were allocated more than one grant.

35. The numbers of grants allocated will continue to change as schools finalise recruitment for the 2019 school year. Where a school notifies the Ministry that they will not be claiming their grant, which could be because they are unable to find suitable beginning teachers, or their circumstances change, the grant, is allocated to another school.

36. In Primary, the three largest allocations of the grants went to Auckland, Taranaki/Wanganui/Manawatu and Tai Tokerau.

37. In Secondary, the three largest allocations of the grants went to Auckland, Wellington and Tai Tokerau.

38. An external and independent review of this initiative is scheduled to begin in the next few months.

Auckland Beginning Teacher Fund (ABT), formally the Auckland BT Project

39. This initiative is managed jointly between the Ministry of Education and Auckland Primary Principals Association, to support beginning teachers in Auckland primary schools through to full certification, ensuring they obtain specialist skills in junior and new entrant classrooms. For the 2019 school year there are 60 places available.

40. Schools are continuing to recruit for beginning teachers for the 2019 school year. As at 4 February 2019, 30 schools have confirmed that they have employed a beginning teacher and are eligible for funding.

41. An evaluation of the fund has been undertaken over the last two years by NZCER. The purpose of the evaluation was to answer three main questions:

- Is the ABT project operating as intended?
- What difference is the project making to the schools and BT’s involved, and what are the critical success factors for the school, the BT and the mentor?
- What lessons does the Auckland BT project have for the broader issues of BT employment and retention?

42. NZCER are currently completing the final evaluation and have advised the final report will be complete in February 2019. The high-level results will be provided to you through our next update.

Voluntary Bonding Scheme (VBS)

43. This initiative encourages newly graduated teachers to teach in certain locations and areas of need for a three year period.

44. Teachers who began teaching in 2018 will be able to apply for voluntary bonding scheme payments within six months of completing three years consecutive employment.

45. The full uptake of the scheme will be known in 2021.
Teacher Education Refresh (TER) Subsidy

46. This initiative is a Teaching Council programme designed for teachers with limited or no teaching experience since qualifying, in particular it is for:
   - Provisionally certificated teachers who have been unable to get a full practising certificate within 6 years of registration
   - Qualified, non-practising teachers, who completed their training more than 6 years ago and who are now applying to become registered.

47. TER enrolment data is collated by the Teaching Council, this data is available to us at a high level by calendar year. Since the subsidy began in February 2018, 1,265 students enrolled to complete TER.

48. Those enrolments are held with Open Polytechnic (773), Auckland University (314), Te Rito Maioha (167) and Institute of Registered Music Teachers.

49. The enrolments can be attributed to the following sectors:
   - ECE (331)
   - Primary (592)
   - Secondary (342).

50. In November, we conducted a survey of TER participants. The response rate for the survey was 35 percent. For those who completed the survey there was a 94 percent completion rate, meaning that six percent exited the survey before completing it. To maintain data integrity we did not delete their answers from our analysis.

51. On entry to the programme:
   - 64 percent were not teaching at all on entry to the programme
   - 36 percent were teaching in some capacity on entry to the programme.

52. Of the respondents:
   - 47 percent have completed the programme
   - 45 percent are still in the process of completing the programme
   - 6 percent did not complete the programme
   - 2 percent deferred completion.

53. Of the students who completed the programme:
   - 79 percent are teaching in some capacity, however, 22 percent of those students already had teaching roles on entry to the programme which is an increase of 109 teachers entering the classroom who were not previously teaching
   - 19 percent are not teaching at all and are still looking for a teaching role
   - 2 percent have chosen not to enter the teaching profession.

54. Of the 140 students who had completed the programme by November and are teaching in some capacity:
   - 27 percent have entered the Early Childhood Education sector
   - 46 percent have entered the Primary sector (two of the 65 have entered Māori Medium)
26 percent have entered the Secondary sector.

55. In summary, 22 percent of students were already teaching and have been able to remain teaching through completing the TER and 78 percent of students have entered classrooms as a result of completing TER.

Returning New Zealand and Overseas Trained Teacher Recruitment

56. This is a targeted recruitment campaign to attract New Zealand trained teachers home, and overseas trained teachers with comparable qualifications and subject expertise in areas of identified shortage to come and teach in New Zealand.

57. The weekly overseas recruitment dashboard as at 3 February 2019, showed that the recruitment agencies have had 1,028 applicants (47 percent being primary teachers and 53 percent being secondary teachers) made available for principals to interview.

58. Of these 223 have accepted roles, with 141 in primary, 90 in secondary and two special education schools.

59. Nine New Zealand teachers returning home accepted roles. This is low, however, New Zealand teachers traditionally use their own networks when returning home and therefore do not need to utilise recruitment agencies. This means that we do not always have visibility of them through this initiative.

60. As at 3 February, principals have lodged 256 teaching roles with the recruitment agencies; some of these roles may be duplicates as principals are not restricted to lodging their roles with only one recruiter.

61. The teaching roles lodged consist of 54 percent secondary teachers (of which 44 percent are STM) and 46 percent primary teachers.

62. Our cumulative number of roles accepted continues to rise, while total roles lodged has begun to slow but could pick up again.

Roles Accepted as at 23 January 2019

[Graph showing accepted roles from 14 Oct to 27 Jan]
63. A cross agency overseas recruitment working group (MoE, NZQA, MBIE Immigration, Teaching Council, Education Payroll and Salary Assessment) established to support the campaign in September 2018, continue to work collaboratively to ensure the smooth and timely processing of teachers through the visa application, qualification recognition and registration processes. This group has been invaluable in identifying ways to smooth the path for overseas teachers and ensure there are no unnecessary delays.

64. We will ensure that these overseas teachers receive a quality induction into the New Zealand schooling system as outlined in paragraphs 74-80 below regarding Professional Learning and Support Resources.

Oversea Relocation Grant (ORG)

65. This initiative is targeted to attract New Zealand trained teachers home and overseas trained teachers to come and teach in New Zealand. It allows these teachers apply for a grant to offset their relocation costs if they commence employment for at least 12 months in a state or state-integrated school.

66. Since the ORG was introduced on 1 February 2018, we have received applications for a total of 342 ORGs (as at 23 January 2019). Of which 283 have been approved, 21 declined, 1 withdrawn and 27 are still being processed.

67. Of those approved applications:
   - 29 percent (82) were allocated to returning New Zealand trained teachers
   - 71 percent (201) were allocated to overseas-trained teachers.

68. Those teachers who received grants are teaching within the following sectors:
   - Area School (5)
   - Primary (159)
   - Secondary (119)

69. The ORG gives us a good view of New Zealand trained teachers returning from overseas who are not necessarily visible to us through other initiatives.

70. The teachers who were given relocation grants, originated from the following countries:
Finder's Fee

71. This initiative encourages schools to use Ministry appointed recruitment agencies to list their vacancies. If they successfully appoint an overseas teacher, they can apply for the finder’s fee to offset their part of the recruitment costs. When combined with the subsidised recruitment it makes the recruitment process effectively free to the school.

72. Since the finder’s fee was introduced on 10 February 2018, we have reimbursed 61 schools for finder’s fees. Some schools have applied for more than one finder’s fee, therefore as at 23 January 2019, we had received 140 applications, of which 102 were approved, eight declined and 30 are still in processing.

73. Those schools who received finder’s fees are within the following sectors:
   - Area School (1)
   - Primary (63)
   - Secondary (38)

Professional Learning and Support Resources for Overseas-Trained Teachers

74. Alongside the Teaching Council of Aotearoa New Zealand and Otago University, we have developed a package that supports the induction of overseas-trained teachers.

75. This is to ensure all teachers coming to teach in New Zealand know about the importance of identity, language and culture in New Zealand and how these elements will support their delivery of the New Zealand curriculum.

76. In December 2018, two videos were released which introduce the New Zealand education system and cultural context of New Zealand. Overseas-trained teachers are encouraged to watch these prior to arriving in New Zealand.

77. These videos will be followed by a series of online modules and regional workshops.

78. The first four modules will cover an introduction to Te Reo Māori, Tikanga Māori and Culturally Responsive Teaching Practice. The modules will also cover what is needed to gain full certification as a New Zealand teacher.
79. The regional workshops will allow participants to explore these topics in more detail and provide teachers the opportunity to meet with other overseas-trained teachers in their area to share experiences and to build their support networks.

80. Otago University will also be introducing an online facilitator who will be able to answer questions and put teachers in touch with other teachers with subject expertise.

National Vacancy Survey

81. We recently surveyed principals to get an understanding of how many schools were holding vacancies and if these vacancies, when compared to teacher headcount, were significant.

82. The survey opened on 16 January 2019 and closed on 23 January 2019. The survey was received by 2,355 principals, and overall we had a good response rate with 916 principals responding (39% response rate). Of these schools, 29 were primary including four Māori Medium and one was a Māori Medium secondary school.

83. Of the 916 principals who responded, 79 percent indicated they were not holding vacancies and 21 percent were holding vacancies. The majority of these vacancies were in the Auckland and Wellington regions, as shown in the graph below.

84. Thirty schools were holding significant vacancies (>15% apportioned to teacher headcount) and were contacted by the Teacher Supply Team to point them to recruitment agencies and advise of other initiatives that may help them fill those vacancies.

85. Several of the schools had made appointments between completing the survey and being contacted. Some of the roles were indicated on the survey as being full-time roles but on calling these schools, we discovered they were part-time roles. In one instance, the role was to provide release time in a single teacher school.

86. The detailed survey results are attached in Annex 1 of this briefing note.

Marketing Campaign

87. The Teacher Supply investment in December 2017 and Budget 2018 provided funding to support the development of an overarching campaign to raise the status of the teaching profession and encourage the broader public audience to consider a teaching
pathway. This included targeted campaigns to New Zealand trained teachers living overseas, overseas-trained teachers interested in teaching in New Zealand and trained teachers considering returning to the workforce.

88. Following consultation with the sector and priority audiences, the overarching campaign to raise the status of the teaching profession, the 'Become a Teacher' campaign went live in September 2018.

89. The campaign has had wide reach with over one million people having seen elements of the campaign. Advertisements have been received positively amongst public audiences and teachers. Key indicators benchmarked by Colmar Brunton suggested that engagement was positive – enjoyment and recall were notably high.

90. To capture the attention of New Zealand trained teachers living overseas, a further social and digital media 'Bring a Kiwi home' campaign is currently in market. The campaign has been designed in a way that the content is first shared and then those that engage will receive tactical messaging promoting Ministry initiatives such as the Overseas Relocation Grant. Formal analysis will be complete on 6 March 2019.

91. A highly targeted social and digital media campaign to internationally trained teachers resulted in over 21,000 visitors to the cross agency international recruitment online hub. Over 7,000 of these teachers then clicked through to the Ministry's contracted recruitment agents for more information and support. It is anticipated that many of these teachers will have subsequently made contact with the Ministry recruiters.
National Vacancies (as at 9:00 on 24 January 2019)

Survey opened 16 January 2019
Survey closed 23 January 2019
Survey received by 2355 principals
916 principals responded (39% response rate)

Of the 916 principals who responded:
• 78.49 percent (n719) of principals indicated they were holding no vacancies
• 21.51 percent (n197) of principals indicated they were holding vacancies

Of the 917 schools with vacancies:
• 119 schools have 1 vacancy
• 46 schools have 2 vacancies
• 19 schools have 3 vacancies
• 6 schools have 4 vacancies
• 2 schools have 5 vacancies
• 1 school has 7 vacancies
• 3 schools have less than 1 vacancy
• 1 school exited survey before answering

Note: A significant vacancy is where 15% or more of teaching positions are vacant for an individual school

When each vacancy is apportioned to school size, 15 percent (n30) have been identified as having significant vacancies and were contacted by phone to point them towards recruitment agencies and to provide advice on other initiatives available to them to help fill the vacancies.

The 30 Schools holding significant vacancies have a total of 48 vacancies.

On calling these schools, 4 have indicated that they have filled the roles since completing the survey and significant vacancies are currently at 44.

Of those 44, 3 are part-time roles.

The 197 schools have a total of 309 vacancies:
• 119 schools have 1 vacancy
• 46 schools have 2 vacancies
• 19 schools have 3 vacancies
• 6 schools have 4 vacancies
• 2 schools have 5 vacancies
• 1 school has 7 vacancies
• 3 schools have less than 1 vacancy
• 1 school exited survey before answering

Of those 30 schools holding significant vacancies (15% or greater), 2 have vacancies lodged with Randstad.

Of those remaining 167 schools who have vacancies, 31 have vacancies lodged with Randstad.

If the significance level is adjusted to >=10%, there are:
• 45 schools with a total of 71 Vacancies.
• 29 are for 1 teaching position at a school
• 10 are for 2 teaching positions at a school