Education Report: Hato Petera College Decision

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>To:</th>
<th>Hon Chris Hipkins, Minister of Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date:</td>
<td>31 May 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priority:</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security Level:</td>
<td>In Confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METIS No:</td>
<td>1129291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drafter:</td>
<td>Philippa Pidd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDI:</td>
<td>s 9(2)(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Contact:</td>
<td>Katrina Casey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDI:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Messaging seen by Communications team:</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Round Robin:</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Purpose of Report

This report provides you with the consultation feedback received about the proposed cancellation of the integration agreement for Hato Petera College, in Auckland’s North Shore.

It also recommends you agree to the Proprietor’s proposal that the College’s integration agreement should be cancelled under section 430 of the Education Act 1989.

Summary

1. In November 2017 we briefed you on the situation at Hato Petera College and informed you, that in 2015, the Catholic Bishop of Auckland (the Proprietor) had requested cancellation of the College’s integration agreement. After undertaking consultation in 2016, the decision was made to retain the school.

2. On 26 October 2017 the Proprietor wrote to you requesting you give consideration to cancellation of the College’s integration agreement by mutual agreement under section 430 of the Education Act 1989. On 4 April 2018 you replied to the Proprietor asking the Bishop to begin a process of consultation about the possible cancellation of the integration agreement.

3. We also undertook consultation with the boards of schools whose rolls might be affected and with sector groups (including Iwi). Both the Proprietor’s and Ministry’s consultation processes finished on 14 May 2018.

4. All four of the submissions the Ministry received during the consultation period, supported the cancellation of the integration agreement. You also received two submissions as did Hon Kelvin Davis (two of these were received outside of the consultation period). Three of the submissions sent to you and Minister Davis support the College being retained and in some way changed, the fourth asks for innovative and creative education opportunities to be provided for Māori.
5. On Friday 25 May you received a report from the Proprietor about its consultation process. As part of this process Bishop Patrick Dunn received 43 submissions (36 supported keeping the College open but as a boarding school, three believed the College should be closed and the remaining had other responses e.g. they wanted to lease the land should the school be closed, they blamed the board /proprietor for the school getting in to this situation).

6. Hato Petera College opened this year with fewer than five students enrolled. Early in the term the Commissioner met with whānau to inform them that the College was unable to provide a full curriculum. The Diocese and the Ministry have supported whānau and students who requested to enrol at other schools and provided assistance to transition to them.

7. As of 14 May, there are four students enrolled at the College. Two of these students recently enrolled at the school during early May.

8. Because the school is currently governed by a Commissioner, if you decide to agree with the Proprietor and cancel the College’s integration agreement we would usually give a period, of at least 28 days, for the Commissioner to provide any further information on why the school’s integration agreement should not be cancelled. This mirrors the process for closure of an ordinary state school.

9. Following this period for final feedback we will provide you with a further Education Report seeking your final decision.

10. After considering all the submissions, we recommend that you agree to cancel the College’s integration agreement and that you ask the Commissioner to provide you with any final reasons why this should not happen.
Recommended Actions

The Ministry of Education recommends you:

a  **consider** the submissions about the possible cancellation of the integration agreement for Hato Petera College;

b  **agree** with the Proprietor’s proposal that the integration agreement should be cancelled under section 430 of the Education Act 1989. This is the Ministry’s recommended action;

If you agree, you are asked to:

c  **sign** the attached letter to the Commissioner asking him to provide you with any final information about why the integration agreement should not be cancelled. This letter should be returned to the Ministry to be hand delivered to the Commissioner.

If you disagree, and wish to retain the school, you are asked to:

d  **sign** the letter refusing to agree to cancellation of the integration agreement and return it to the Ministry to be hand delivered; and

Release:

e  **proactively release** this Education Report as per your expectation that information be released proactively. Any information which may need to be withheld will be done so in line with the provisions of the Official Information Act 1982.

Katrina Casey  
Deputy Secretary  
Sector Enablement and Support  
31/5/2018

Hon Chris Hipkins  
Minister of Education  
13/6/18
Background

1. Hato Petera College (the College) is a state integrated, co-educational, decile 3, secondary school, situated in Northcote, Auckland.

2. The College's maximum roll is 245 students. Its 1 March 2018 roll of three was comprised of students who all identified as Māori. At the beginning of Term 2 only one student was enrolled. Currently there are four students enrolled at the school as of 14 May.

3. The College was established in 1928 by the Roman Catholic Bishop of the Diocese of Auckland (the Diocese) and ran as a private school until 1981 when it was integrated into the state school system. The College was integrated as a school for boys, principally but not exclusively of Māori descent. It had a roll of 215 on 1 March 1980 and it opened with a maximum roll of 225 students. It became co-educational in 1993.

4. At that time, private schools were integrated into the state system under the Private Schools Conditional Integration Act 1975 (the PSCI Act). Under the PSCI Act, the Minister of Education (on behalf of the Crown) and the Proprietor enter into an Integration Agreement, which, together with the PSCI Act, sets the terms and conditions for integration of a private school into the state system. An Integration Agreement is a legally binding Deed of agreement between the Crown and the Proprietor. The PSCI Act was repealed in May of 2017 and the legislation that governs state integrated schools is now contained in Part 33 of the Education Act 1989.

5. In October 2017 the Proprietor of the College, Bishop Patrick Dunn, the Catholic Bishop of Auckland, wrote to you raising concerns about the college and requesting that you give consideration to cancellation of the College's integration agreement by mutual agreement. In April 2018, you replied to the Proprietor asking that he undertake consultation about the possible cancellation of the school's integration agreement.

6. The results of the Proprietor's consultation are attached as Annex 1.

Consultation

7. The Key themes from the Proprietor's consultation were:
   a. The concerns impacting the viability of the school were not addressed by submitters. Though 43 submissions were received, many submitters argued that the school should remain open because of its history and the pride of former pupils.
   b. Due to the low roll number, curriculum delivery is severely curtailed, extra-curricular options are limited and the special Catholic character is being compromised. This has impacted student achievement and progression to tertiary study.
   c. Ongoing governance issues that led to the appointment of a Commissioner at Hato Petera, as well as serious financial issues, have led to the College being overlooked as a schooling option for Catholic Māori in Auckland and Tai Tokerau.
Ministry comment

8. The Ministry agrees with the Proprietor, that as it stands, the education of the students attending Hato Petera College is being compromised. The low roll, as well as the governance and financial issues that have led to the current situation at the school, mean it is no longer a school of choice for Catholic Māori within the Catholic Diocese of Auckland. The 15 other Catholic secondary schools that are within the Diocese are the preferred options over Hato Petera College.

Consultation Feedback from the Ministry’s Consultation and submissions sent to Ministers

9. In April 2018 we also undertook consultation, on your behalf, about the possible cancellation of the school’s integration agreement. We consulted 18 schools whose rolls might be affected if the integration agreement is cancelled, the Commissioner and 17 sector groups (including Iwi from across the region).

10. We received four submissions during the consultation period, one from the Commissioner and three from sector groups. All supported the cancellation of the integration agreement.

11. You also received two emails from community members, one asking you to retain the College and allow it to grow and the other asking you to support innovative and creative ways of providing education for Māori. Minister Davis also received two submissions, one asking him to intervene in the process and challenge the Bishop to remember his obligations to the kura and to Māori and the other asking for support with retaining the College.

12. TV news and social media also showed a video of Stephanie Pomare, the then sole student at Hato Petera College. The Facebook clip featuring her situation had more than 12,000 viewings.

13. The key themes from the Ministry’s consultation were:

a. Hato Petera College has had a proud history, and a tradition of supporting Māori through providing a rich and quality education. In recent years however Catholic Māori students in Auckland have enrolled in other Catholic Colleges and have achieved better at those schools than students at Hato Petera.

b. The Hato Petera College that exists today is much diminished from the school it was in the past.

i. Current operational costs are approximately $550,000 per annum. In the past up to 80% of the operational funding was being used to pay support staff and less than 1% for curriculum delivery.

For the College to stay open there would need to be a significant cash injection made by the Ministry of Education to cover existing and future debts along with contingent liabilities that remain since the time the school had an operational hostel.

ii. Curriculum delivery – there are four staff currently employed at the College. Any teaching programme is constrained by what teachers can teach as opposed to the preferred options or needs of the student/s.

None of the staff are qualified to provide literacy at Level 1 and beyond. If a student enrolled at Year 11 or above such programmes would have to be taught through Te Kura (the Correspondence School) or virtual learning networks.
Student attendance is sporadic and so there are limited opportunities for the students to have social interaction with peers. The classroom environment is lonely, despite the best intentions of the staff.

iii. **Property** – the proprietor owns the property at Hato Petera College, but the Board has responsibility for maintenance. The Board had spent little or no money on property other than security, cleaning, rubbish removal and minor repairs and maintenance.

For Hato Petera to remain open will require the Proprietor to invest significantly in the property to address outstanding issues and improve the street appeal to attract students back to the fold.

iv. **Staff morale** – Staff are worried about their futures and want certainty in their life as professionals.

The Commissioner has been advised by staff that they would like the College closed and would encourage those making the decision to expedite the decision–making process as soon as possible. The Commissioner shares this opinion.

v. **Hato Petera College’s place in the educational network** – Hato Petera College is a co-educational, secondary day school. Many of the supporters reference what the school was like in a time when it was a Māori boarding school for boys. Since this time the school has changed significantly.

For Hato Petera College to compete with Rosmini or Carmel, it would have to rebrand and be marketed as a viable schooling option.

c. The proposed cancellation of the integration agreement is supported by APIS, welcomed by NZEI and is not objected to by NZSTA.

d. No submissions were received from the boards of schools whose rolls might be affected, Iwi or PPTA.

e. Four other submissions were received, two sent to you directly and the other two sent to Hon Kelvin Davis.

i. One submission emailed to you included a link to the Facebook video showing the (at that time) sole student at the College. It also acknowledged the College’s history and its potential for the future. The submitter requests that the College be revitalised and not closed.

ii. A second submission sent to you requests that you support innovative and creative ways of providing education for Māori. It requests that there are more opportunities for Māori, not less. It highlights that Māori need ownership and empowerment, the rebuilding of Māori identity and self-faith.

iii. A submission to Hon Kelvin Davis identifies high levels of support for the College and asks Minister Davis for his support to retain the school. The submitter attended Hato Pereta College and has been involved in rallying support for the College to stay open.
iv. The second submission to Hon Davis asks for him to intervene in the destruction of the much loved kura. It challenges him to pull the Bishop up and remind him of his obligations to the kura and to Māori.

14. The submissions from the Ministry’s consultation and the emails sent to you and Hon Kelvin Davis are attached in full as Annex 2 for your consideration.

Ministry Comment

15. We acknowledge that Hato Petera College has been a significant College for the Catholic Diocese and for Māori in Auckland and the Far North. It has provided quality education and produced leaders for the country.

16. We also support the view that this is no longer the reality of the College and the community has lost confidence in it. As identified by the Commissioner’s submission, there would need to be significant investment in the school by the Proprietor and the Ministry to bring it back to the type of school it once was in its past.

Legal Process

17. Section 430 of the Education Act 1989 provides for the cancellation of an Integration Agreement by mutual agreement between you and the Proprietor, following consultation with other interested persons or groups as both you and the Proprietor consider appropriate. In April 2018 you asked the Proprietor to undertake consultation under the auspices of section 430 – cancellation by mutual agreement [METIS 1039409 refers].

18. As the school has a Commissioner (who does not represent the school community in the same way that a Board of Trustees would), we would recommend that if your decision is to agree to cancel the integration agreement a period of at least 26 days is given for the Commissioner to provide any further arguments against cancellation. This mirrors the process followed in the closure of an ordinary state school.

19. If you agree to mutually cancel the integration agreement, Hato Petera will cease to be a state integrated school, and the respective rights and obligations of the parties that arise by virtue of the integration agreement will cease to have effect.

20. In the absence of an agreement in place, Hato Petera will be treated as a provisionally registered private school under section 35A of the Education Act. The Proprietor has proposed that should the agreement be cancelled, he will close the college.

Staff at the College

21. There are currently four teachers at Hato Petera - the Principal, the Deputy Principal, a teacher of science and a teacher of art.

22. At present these teachers are providing education to the students still attending the school.
23. Under the provisions of the Secondary Teachers’ Collective Agreement permanent teaching positions identified as surplus will be effectively disestablished at the start of the next school year. This means that permanently employed teachers can only start their supernumerary option from this time. Should the integration agreement be cancelled and the school closes before this date, the permanently employed teachers staff would become the employees of the Ministry and we would work with PPTA to organise for them work at another school, or undertake suitable study until the effective date of disestablishment (i.e. 28 January 2019).

24. Under the Secondary Principals’ Collective Agreement the principal must receive at least 3 months’ notice of the decision to disestablish their position during which time the Board must assist the principal to locate a suitable alternate position. Where no position is found the principal must be offered the surplus staffing options set out in the collective agreement.

Options

25. After considering all the submissions, we are providing you with two options for your consideration:

Option 1 (Ministry’s Preferred Option)
- Agree that the integration agreement of Hato Petera College should be cancelled by mutual agreement with the Proprietor under section 430 of the Education Act (and invite the Commissioner of the college to let you know, within 28 days, of any final arguments against cancellation he may wish to provide).

Or

Option 2
- Decide that you will not agree to cancellation of the integration agreement and sign the attached letter to the Proprietor informing him of your decision.

Waitangi Tribunal Claims

26. Hato Petera is the subject of two current Waitangi Tribunal claims. The first (Wai 1385) was made in relation to historical concerns relating to the land on which the College is sited. The Crown gifted the land to the Catholic Church in the 19th century and the claimants assert the Church should not have sold various parcels of land. The Tribunal is inquiring into these historical issues and is not inquiring into the contemporary situation regarding the school and boarding facility.

27. The second claim sought an urgent hearing on behalf of Māori parents of present and prospective pupils of the College. The application argued that the lack of boarding facilities at Hato Petera will adversely impact the ability of the college to provide for the maintenance, dissemination and advancement of te reo Māori and mātauranga Māori in violation of the Crown’s Treaty obligations.

28. The application for urgent hearing was declined. The Tribunal noted that the issues forming the backdrop of the claim would be considered as part of the kaupapa inquiry into education discussed below.
29. Education is also the fifth inquiry of a series of kaupapa inquiries around Crown Policy announced in 2015. It will likely address the issues that form the backdrop of Wai 1385 claim. It is currently scheduled to commence in 2018. This is also part of a larger ongoing district inquiry (Wai 1040) regarding Te Paparahu o Te Raki (Northland). This is an inquiry into 420 claims, which relate to education, and the Crown's failure to provide active protection in relation to te reo and mātauranga Māori. The inquiry is still ongoing and hearings are in stage two.

30. It is possible a further urgent claim may be lodged as a proposed closure would be a matter of current/pending Crown action. Any Māori person who asset a significant and irreversible prejudice arising out of the Crown's actions in agreeing to cancel the integration agreement and the consequential closure of the College that this will entail could bring an application.

Conclusion

33. While there is some support for the College remaining open, this appears to be primarily from students who remember their educational experience and would like this continued for current students. Unfortunately the College is no longer able to replicate this experience.

34. The Commissioner, APIS, NZEI, NZSTA and staff either support, or do not oppose the cancellation of the school's integration agreement.

35. No comment was received from the boards of schools whose rolls might be affected. This may be because they do not consider that the low roll will impact on their roll, or because they consider that closure is inevitable, or that they do not wish to reply.

36. In the 2016 consultation there was clear support for the College from Iwi. This has not been evident in the current consultation. This may mean that they have acknowledged the lack of support for the College from their whānau, or that they consider that their voice will not be effective in retaining the College and returning it to its historical stature.

37. The College has few students, and the Commissioner has highlighted issues with the College's finances, property, curriculum delivery, morale, and place in the network. The Commissioner concludes "It is in the Commissioner's professional opinion that Hato Petera College is not sustainable.... In my professional capacity as Commissioner I believe the integration agreement of Hato Petera College should be cancelled."
38. The Proprietor believes the situation at Hato Petera College to be untenable and requests that the integration agreement be cancelled with urgency. It believes that the education of the students is being severely compromised, and the position of the staff is also seen as untenable. Submissions received offered no viable alternatives nor addressed the issues impacting on Hato Petera. The demand for Māori boarding schools has declined nationally and Catholic Māori are still catered for in Auckland with 15 other Catholic secondary schools able to provide education for Māori as Māori. Hato Petera is not the secondary school of choice for Catholic Māori.

39. We recommend that you agree that the integration agreement should be cancelled and invite the Commissioner to provide you with any last comments on the proposal.

Proactive Release

40. It is intended that this Education Report is proactively released as per your expectation that information be released as soon as possible. Any information which may need to be withheld will be done so in line with the provisions of the Official Information Act 1982.
Bishop Patrick Dunn  
Proprietor of Hato Petera College  
Private Bag 47904  
Ponsonby  
Auckland 1144

Dear Bishop Dunn,

Thank you for your letter of 25 May that accompanied your report on the consultation you have undertaken as part of the process for the mutual cancellation of the integration agreement of Hato Petera.

After reviewing the feedback in your report, as well as considering the submissions presented to me from the community along with a report from the Ministry of Education on the situation, I have decided to agree to cancel the College’s integration agreement.

I will now invite the Commissioner to provide me with any final arguments for the school remaining open. Although this step is not expressly required by the legislation for state integrated schools, it is used in state schools where there is a Commissioner in place of the board. I therefore consider that it is best practice and in accordance with section 475 of the Act which requires that the integrated school provisions be interpreted consistently with the rest of the Act where this is appropriate and reasonable. The Commissioner will have up to 28 days to provide me with his final comments.

Yours sincerely,

Chris Hipkins  
Minister of Education

cc: Isabel Evans, Director of Education, Auckland  
    Paul Ferris, CEO, APIS
Lex Hamill  
Commissioner  
Hato Petera College  
103 College Road  
Northcote  
Auckland 0627

Dear Lex

The Proprietor of Hato Petera and I have agreed to mutually cancel the integration agreement of Hato Petera College, under section 430 of the Education Act 1989.

I now invite you, as Commissioner of Hato Petera, to provide me within 28 days any further reasons you may wish to put forward as to why the agreement should not be cancelled. After I have received and considered any further information you may wish to put forward, I will then either confirm my decision to cancel the integration agreement or reverse it.

You may be assured that I have not made this decision lightly, and encourage you to work with Leisa Maddix, Manager Education in the Ministry of Education's Auckland office. You are able to contact her at leisa.maddix@education.govt.nz or on 09 632 9422.

I look forward to hearing from you in due course.

Yours sincerely,

Chris Hipkins  
Minister of Education

cc Isabel Evans, Director of Education, Auckland  
Bishop Patrick Dunn, Catholic Bishop of Auckland  
Paul Ferris, CEO, APIS
Annexes

Annex 1: Report from the Proprietor

Annex 2: Other Submissions:
- The Commissioner of Hato Petera College
- APIS
- NZEI
- NZSTA
- Section 9(2)(a)

Late submissions from Section 9(2)(a)
Annex 1: Report from the Proprietor
25 May 2018

Hon Chris Hipkins
Minister of Education
Parliament Office
Private Bag 18888
Parliament Buildings
WELLINGTON

Dear Minister

Re: Consultation Report Regarding the Long-Term Viability of Hato Petera College

I refer to your letter of 4 April 2018. I have now undertaken a consultation with the community, about the long-term viability of Hato Petera College, including the possible cancellation of the Integration Agreement.

Please find enclosed a copy of the report prepared following the conclusion of the consultation process. 43 submissions were received. In preparing the report I have carefully considered the views expressed in each of the submissions.

In my view, none of the submissions received addressed the concerns impacting on the viability of the College. A key theme of many submitters was that the school should remain open because of its history and the pride and loyalty of past pupils. Whilst I empathise with these sentiments, this however, is not a sufficient basis to keep the College open. Hato Petera College today is not the College it was in the past. The education of students currently attending the College is being severely compromised.

I am confident that the 15 other Catholic secondary schools within the Catholic Diocese of Auckland can effectively cater for the education of Māori as Māori. Schooling provision and education is rapidly changing in the 21st Century. Every student should have an opportunity to excel to the best of their abilities. In the case of Māori students, this means achieving education success as Māori as well as accepting the values and ways of being Catholic.

You may be aware that the 1850 Deed of Grant concerning the land the school is located on provided for the support of a school “for the education of children of our subjects of both races and of children of the poor and destitute persons”. I am strongly of the view that the property should continue to be utilised for this purpose, although it is currently premature to provide any firm future options.
The consultation process has confirmed my belief that Hato Petera College is no longer viable or able to provide an education that best meets the needs of students. The current situation is critical and the education of students is being compromised and adversely impacted in all areas.

Given the findings of the report, I confirm my request that the Integration Agreement for Hato Petera College be cancelled under Section 430 of the Education Act 1989 and that subsequently the College be closed. I also respectfully request that the decision be made with urgency and that the College be closed for instruction immediately.

Yours sincerely

Patrick Dunn
Bishop of Auckland

Encl

cc. Mariette van Ryn, Diocesan General Manager, Catholic Diocese of Auckland
    Linda McQuade, Vicar for Education, Catholic Diocese of Auckland
CATHOLIC DIOCESE OF AUCKLAND
Pompallier Diocesan Centre, 30 New Street
Private Bag 47-904, Ponsonby, Auckland 1144
Ph: 378 4380

A REPORT ON THE LONG TERM VIABILITY OF
HATO PETERA COLLEGE
AND
POSSIBLE CANCELLATION OF THE INTEGRATION AGREEMENT
FOLLOWING A CONSULTATION PROCESS

MAY 2018
CONTENTS

1. Executive Summary 3
2. Background Information 6
3. 2018 Consultation Process 7
4. Submissions Received 9
5. Issues Detailed For Consideration And Responses Received In Submissions 14
6. Catholic Education For Māori As Māori 19
7. Conclusion 22
8. Appendices:
   I. Hato Petera College and the Crown Grant 1850. 23
   II. 1 July School Rolls of Catholic secondary schools in the Diocese. 24
   III. Retention rates of students past the age of compulsory education in Catholic secondary schools in the Diocese. 25
   IV. Achievement rates in NCEA Level 1, Level 2 and Level 3 at the secondary schools in the Diocese. 26
   V. Participation rates in Tertiary Studies for students leaving Catholic secondary schools in the Diocese. 29
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- The Catholic Bishop of Auckland as Proprietor of Hato Petera College by mutual agreement with the Minister of Education, under section 430 Education Act 1989 has undertaken a second consultation process about the possible cancellation of the Integration Agreement for Hato Petera College.

- This consultation process was undertaken as a result of serious concerns about the viability of Hato Petera as a College and whether it is able to provide students with a quality Catholic education which students are entitled to and deserve.

- These concerns were substantiated by the 27 October 2017 confirmed ERO report:

  “ERO has continuing concerns about the performance and future viability of Hato Petera College. Despite the efforts of the principal and staff, ERO is not assured that the school is able to offer a quality sustainable education for its students.

  The school has had a history, since 2010, of longitudinal ERO evaluations which have identified concerns about the quality of education and student wellbeing.

  Over the past 3 years there has been insufficient progress in addressing the areas identified for improvement in the 2014 ERO report. ERO is concerned that the school does not have the capacity to address these issues.

  The school is not well placed to sustain or improve its performance. Contributing issues are:

  • concerns regarding the development and future sustainability of the curriculum
  • lack of internal evaluation processes
  • risks to financial sustainability
  • low student and staff numbers predicted for 2018.

  ERO recommends that the Ministry of Education, the board and proprietors work to secure the future education and wellbeing of the students and determine the future of the school.

  ERO has continuing concerns about the performance and future viability of Hato Petera College. Despite the efforts of the principal and staff, ERO is not assured that the school is able to offer a quality sustainable education for its students.” Confirmed ERO Report 26/10/2017.

- The first consultation process undertaken with the approval of the Minister of Education began in July 2016. At this time the Proprietor had concerns about the long term viability of the College due to issues around the low number of students enrolled, the impact the low roll has on the breadth of curriculum that could be offered, the financial position of the College, breaches to the integration agreement, and the breakdown in the relationship between the College Board of Trustees and Hato Petera Ltd (previously Te Whanau o Hato Petera Trust Board) which impacted on the governance of the school. Meetings were held with all of the stakeholders and 6 consultation Hui were held. Written submissions were also received. A report was prepared and submitted to the Minister of Education on 12 September 2016. On the 17 November 2016 the Minister informed the Proprietor and the Board of Trustees of her decision not to close the school.

- Previously the Proprietor provided boarding hostel facilities to the students. However for a range of reasons including long standing and insurmountable health and safety issues together with financial difficulties, the Proprietor elected to close the hostel. Hato Petera College became a day school only in 2017.
• The Proprietors concerns about the provision of a quality Catholic education for students at Hato Peterea College has intensified in 2017. As at 1 July 2017 the roll was 14 students. At the start of the 2018 school year the roll was 5 students and by the end of the end of Term 1 only 1 student remained.

• Indications are that Hato Peterea College is clearly no longer viable and despite best efforts in the last few years the College has not been able to make the necessary changes required to address the issues raised in the first consultation process. The roll has dropped significantly. Catholic Māori are increasingly choosing the other 15 Catholic secondary schools within the Catholic Diocese as their preferred option for Catholic secondary education.

• In January 2018, the Secretary of Education appointed a Commissioner to replace and assume the responsibilities of the Board of Trustees.

• On 10 April 2018, following receipt of a letter from the Minister of Education, a new consultation process was initiated. This consultation has been undertaken by mutual agreement, under section 430 of the Education Act 1989 regarding the possible cancellation of the integration agreement for Hato Peterea College. The issues specifically raised for consideration in the 2018 Consultation Document were:

1. **The low roll number**: This decreased from a high of 148 in 2009 to 14 on 1 July 2017. By the end of Term 1 2018 there was only 1 student at the school. Resultant consequences of the decrease in roll include:
   - *Curriculum delivery being severely curtailed* – even prior to 2016 the College offered an extremely limited range of subjects in Years 11-13.
   - *Extra-curricular options* – group/team sport and cultural activities have become increasingly difficult to offer.
   - *Catholic Special Character* of the school has been severely compromised. Many breaches of the Integration Agreement prior to 2017 have not been addressed.

2. **Low levels of student achievement and progression to tertiary study**: This is of particular concern especially for Māori:
   - 42.5% of school leavers attained NCEA Level 3 in 2014; 66.7% in 2015; 35.7% in 2016.
   - 16.1% of school leavers attained University Entrance in 2013; 6.7% in 2014; 0% in 2015 and 2016; 20% (1 student) in 2017.
   - 9.68% of leavers progressed to University study in 2013; 28.57% in 2014; 10.53% in 2015.
   - 48.39% of leavers did not progress to any form of tertiary study in 2013; 50.7% in 2014; 57.89% in 2015.

3. **Ongoing governance issues**: A Limited Statutory Manager (LSM) was appointed in March 2017. He assumed responsibility for the establishment of Board policies and procedures, financial operations, management of communications, and employment of staff. Even with the appointment of the LSM, two highly respected and experienced Bishop Appointees resigned from the Board of Trustees in August 2017 because of ongoing governance issues. The LSM was appointed to the role of Commissioner in January 2018.

4. **Serious financial issues**: The College has been in a position of negative equity since 2012:
   - 2012 Equity ($113,051); 2013 ($65,205); 2014 ($33,991); 2015 ($72,599).
   - 2016 and 2017 accounts have still not been audited.
Continued financial support for a school with so few students is not an effective use of government funding, especially in the current environment where government recognises the need for additional financial provision for education.

- The Diocesan consultation process was undertaken via written submissions only. A total of 43 email submissions were received from individuals or groups. All submissions have been carefully considered in the presentation of this report (Report). In summary:
  - 28 out of the 43 submissions received came from people who regard themselves as being associated with or members of Tauira Tawhito – Te Whanau o Hato Petera, or who been contacted by people from this group. All of these submission supported the continuation of the school. Only one of these submissions offered a proposal regarding the continuation of the school.
  - Only 3 submission were from people who made individual submissions during the 2016 consultation process. None of these addressed the specific issues raised in the Consultation Document.
  - 2 submissions were received from people who attended 2016 consultation Hui, one of whom was a member of a group who made a submission in 2016. Neither of these addressed the specific issues raised in the Consultation Document.
  - 3 submitters believed the College should be closed. 2 of these submitters had been victims of abuse.

**Key Outcomes of Consultation**

- The submissions received during the consultation process have not provided solutions to the Proprietor’s specific concerns about the viability of Hato Petera College.

- As matters currently stand the education of students is being severely compromised. It is understood that 3 students are now attending the College but their attendance is spasmodic at best. It goes without saying that the lives of these students will be adversely impacted by the College’s inability to provide them with an education they need and deserve.

- In addition the position of staff at the College is a cause for concern. They are currently unable to undertake their professional responsibilities in a school environment which is stimulating and invigorating. This is untenable for them and there is no prospect of this changing.

- Hato Petera College is not the secondary school of choice for Catholic Māori, within the Catholic Diocese of Auckland. Past students have chosen not to send their children and grandchildren to Hato Petera College. The 15 Catholic secondary schools within the Catholic Diocese of Auckland are preferred options for Catholic Māori. We are confident they are able to provide education for Māori as Māori.

- The closure of Hato Petera would enable the facilities to be used by an alternative education provider. At this time the Diocese has no intention of selling the College.

- The longstanding concerns of the Proprietor about the viability of Hato Petera College remain unaddressed and accordingly he sees no option other than for the Integration Agreement be cancelled with urgency.
2. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

About the College

Hato Petera College is a co-educational Year 9-13 state integrated school, established under the Private Schools Conditional Integration Agreement 1975 (PCSI Act). It is located in Northcote on Auckland’s North Shore. The College was a boarding school established to educate Catholic boys, who were predominantly but not exclusively Māori. In 1993 the school became a co-educational school when a Supplementary Deed to the school’s Integration Agreement enabled the enrolment of girls.

By 2015 the hostel had become financially insolvent, and there were significant concerns about the health and safety of students. This culminated on the 20 September 2016 with the Ministry of Education cancelling the hostel licence. This was the result of continuing concerns about the ability of the hostel management and staff to provide a safe environment for boarders. Because of the very poor state of the majority of the hostel facilities, ongoing concerns about the ability of hostel management and staff to provide a safe environment for boarders combined with the ongoing financial difficulties that had been experienced with running the hostel, the Proprietor decided that the hostel would be closed permanently.

The College’s Integration Agreement was amended on 4 May 2017 and Hato Petera became a school for day students only.

Hato Petera Property

The Bishop of the Catholic Diocese of Auckland is the owner of all the land associated with the property at 102 College Road Northcote. This property encompasses Hato Petera College and as well as land on the other side of the road from the College where the boarding hostel had been located.

The closure of the College would enable the facilities to be used by an alternative education provider. At this time the Diocese has no intention of selling the College.

The Diocese is committed to ensuring that the intent of the Deed of Grant made in 1850 in relation to the land, is honoured and that the land, or income from the land will be used to support “... the education of our subjects of children of both races and of children of other poor and destitute persons being inhabitants of the islands of the Pacific...” (Deed of Grant, 19 August 1850) \(^1\)

---

\(^1\) Appendix 1
3. 2018 CONSULTATION PROCESS

2016 Consultation

The Proprietor of Hato Petera College has had serious concerns, for a number of years, about the ability of the school to provide students with a quality Catholic education they deserve. The 2016 consultation about the long term viability of Hato Petera College was motivated by the following areas of primary concern for the Proprietor:

- Low number of students enrolled.
- Impact of the low roll on the breadth of curriculum.
- Breaches to the Integration Agreement.
- Financial position of the school.
- Breakdown in relationships between the Board of Trustees and the Hato Petera Ltd, the body responsible for the governance and management of the hostel.

Following the completion of the consultation process a report was prepared and submitted to the Minister of Education on 12 September 2016.

On the 20 September 2016 the Ministry of Education cancelled the hostel licence.

On the 17 December 2016 the Minister informed the Proprietor of her decision to decline the request to cancel the Integration Agreement. The Proprietor accepted this decision but also resolved that Hato Petera College would operate as a school for day students only due to continuing and insurmountable issues with boarding hostel.

2018 Consultation Process

Over the 12 months since the decision was made not to close the College, the Proprietor’s concern about the viability of Hato Petera College and the quality of education able to be provided for students have intensified. It is clear that in 2017 and 2018 the College has been unable to provide students with an education that prepares them to have the mana and the skills and qualifications which will enable them to take their place in society as fulfilled and confident young Māori men and women in the 21st century.

Accordingly the Proprietor wrote to the Minister of Education on 26 October 2017 and requested that the decision of the former Minister of Education not to cancel the Integration Agreement of Hato Petera be reconsidered. The grounds were:

1. Low and declining roll number: As at 1 July 2017 roll of 14 students. As a consequence:
   - Curriculum delivery was severely compromised with students being offered only the subjects teachers can teach, not the range of subjects students need.
   - Students are being denied opportunities to engage with other students of their own ages and to participate in the range of extra-curricular activities offered by most secondary schools.
   - Aspects of the schools Catholic Special Character was being severely compromised with Special Character initiatives being largely limited to karakia each morning.

2. Continuing governance issues which resulted in the two highly regarded and experienced Bishop Appointees on the Board resigning in August 2017.

3. The College was in financial crisis and without additional financial assistance from the Ministry of Education potentially unable to meet all liabilities.

4. The amended draft ERO report questioning the sustainability of the College.
On 6 April 2018 a letter was received from the Minister of Education inviting the Proprietor to begin a new consultation process about the possible cancellation of the integration agreement for the College, by mutual agreement, under section 430 of the Education Act 1989.

It was agreed with the Ministry of Education that the Diocesan consultation process would be via written submissions only and that no Hui would be held. However, a meeting was held with the staff of Hato Petera College on Tuesday 10 April 2017 to personally inform them of the consultation process.

Consultation began on Tuesday 10 April 2018 with the publication of the Diocesan consultation document on the Catholic Diocese of Auckland website http://www.aucklandcatholic.org.nz. Submissions could be received by emailing hapoteraconsulting@cda.org.nz or by mail to Hato Petera Consultation, Pompallier Diocesan Centre, Private Bag 47 904, Ponsonby, Auckland 1144. The closing date for submissions was 5pm 14 May 2018.

Comprehensive advertising of the Consultation Process took place by way of:

- Media statement sent on 7 April 2018 to: Radio NZ News; NewstalkZB; TVNZ news; Marae (TVNZ); Te Karere (TVNZ); Prime TV news; NewsHub (TV3 and RadioLive); Maori Television; NZ Herald; Northern Advocate; Stuff.
- Media statement being published on the “News” section of the Diocesan website
- Notices placed in parish newsletters.
- Notices placed in newsletters of Catholic secondary schools within the Diocese.
- Statement on the Bishop’s Facebook page.
4. SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

- All submissions received were via email. Acknowledgement of receipt was sent by email. The table below lists submissions received and gives a very brief outline of the view of the submitters.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date Received</th>
<th>From</th>
<th>Key views of the submitter(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>11/04/18</td>
<td>Mother of children at Pompallier College</td>
<td>Pompallier College meeting educational and cultural needs – very supporting of Maori culture. Would like an option of weekly boarding. Supports cancellation of Integration Agreement for HP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>13/04/18</td>
<td>Turou Cook Island Catholic Community</td>
<td>HP stigmatised by history and &quot;needs to be cleansed&quot;. Wants Te Puni Kokiri and Ngati Whatua involved. Submission written in support of Te Unga Waka as there has been a long relationship between both groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>17/04/18</td>
<td>Student in 2015</td>
<td>Supports closure. Bullied and beaten by other students in hostel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>23/04/18</td>
<td>Whanau Coordinator Nga Tūra Tawhito Select Committee – Te Whanau Whaniui o Hato Petera (Past Pupil 2001-2006)</td>
<td>Letter requesting meeting with Bishop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>27/04/18</td>
<td>Sent as individual</td>
<td>Facebook post re Stephanie Pomare as sole student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5/05/18</td>
<td>Submission sent and signed by an individual name with status given as a former Head Boy</td>
<td>Commitments made in submission: A willingness to satisfy any associated school debt; injection of $300,000 into the hostel Boarding Facilities presumptive to the boarding license being granted to a new governing Trust formed by members of the Whanau committee; the alignment of the curriculum with the government’s 100 Day Whanau Ora plan and revitalisation of the kura’s academic and Tikanga platforms responsive to the 21st Century; a 3-6 month marketing plan with a long term target of 240 pupils within 24 month; reviewing Hato Petera’s position in 12 months from 6th July 2018.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>&quot;Mother of past students</td>
<td>Supports HP remaining open and reopening of hostel. No reason good enough to close kura.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2003-2005</td>
<td>Supports keeping school open - &quot;time at HP was one of the best times of my life&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2000-2004 (Komiti Member)</td>
<td>Parents § 9(2)(a) - Born at the school. Supports keeping school open. College has been a huge part of her life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>30/04/14</td>
<td></td>
<td>Feels there is a place in Aotearoa for a Maori Co-ed Catholic Boarding school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2002-2006</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open – sense of belonging is still strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open – time at Petera was happy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2005-2008</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open – enjoyed her time there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Finished schooling at HP. Many family members attend HP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2016-2018</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open — HP provides her with a good education but feels it was not just a school but a home for her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2004-2006</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open Feels that it is not just a school but like a papakainga to which past students have a special connection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2001-2004</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open Was a disturbed teenager who now has a lot to thank the kura for</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td><em>Past pupil 1984-1988.</em></td>
<td>In 2013 first of 3 children attend HP. Supports keeping HP open and there is a need to look at ways of restoring the kura</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 1995-1999</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open - dedicated support of whanau government and Church needed to reimage kura</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2006-2007</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open — day student but kura helped him to become the person he today</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2005-2009</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open - provides a life style which cannot be replicated in other schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Would like his children when old enough to attend HP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2000-2003</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Appreciated all of the activities and strong friendships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 1994-1997</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Family members attended. Great experiences as a student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>30/04/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2003-2008</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. HP taught her many life skills including independence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Made her proud to be Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2006-2009</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Was proud to go to the kura and embrace her Maori genealogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 1996-2000</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Tautiko 100%, peers who are voicing their opinions and love to keep the kura open</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Kura is not just a school but a home to Maori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2014</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Taught him many things in the year he attended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. HP has 90 years of history and produced good leaders in the past</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>01/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2000-2004</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Proud Maori women has been shaped by HP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil for 2 and half years</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Showed everyone whanaungatanga</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2004-2006</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Had been in trouble – HP helped to turn him around</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Needed to nurture and bring forth the future generation of taori Maori and leaders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04/05/18</td>
<td>Priest</td>
<td>Maintaining intent of Crown Grant and need to provide whare kai along with whare hui</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 1999-2001 Teacher 2013-2014</td>
<td>School needs to close. Feels a particular ‘Haka’ hangs over HP. She was a student during the time of the “wicked and heinous events”. Believes Te Whanau o Hato Petera directly contributed to significant debt and poor management of the kura. As a beginning teacher she did not get the correct guidance and was taken advantage of.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2004-2008</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Feels that the life skills learned at HP help to shape the person he is today</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08/05/18</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Sees the closure as inevitable but is opposed to the closure – school is uniquely Catholic and Maori.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/05/18</td>
<td>AKO (private primary school)</td>
<td>In the event of closure wish to enter into discussion leasing of facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/05/18</td>
<td>Past pupil 2002-2006</td>
<td>Supports keeping HP open. Whanau all attended HP. Catholic Church needs to invest to re-establish Boarding school and school will flourish</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/05/18</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>HP should close and land and buildings be used for the benefit of all New Zealanders e.g. site of training for unemployed youth or emergency housing. Those who wish school to continue are pushing their own agenda in the guise of helping one student.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14/05/18</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Disappointed that ideas in 2016 submission were not acted on. Requesting a meeting.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14/05/18</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>HP has proud history offers more than education - whanau attended school. Need to replace current principal by a person named in the submission. Boarding is essential suggesting an InZone model. Wishes to speak to her submission</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14/05/18</td>
<td>Individual – past pupil</td>
<td>Whanau history with HP. Long term sustainability relies on whanau – need to inject pride back into school – extend programmes offered and extra-curricular activities; boarding essential; set performance targets.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14/05/18</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Without boarding facilities we have no school. Proprietor has responsibility to address financial difficulties of the school</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates submission received from members of the same family.
Summary of Submissions

- By way of summary:
  - 36 of the 43 submissions supported keeping Hato Petera College open but as a boarding school. There are clear indications that 28 of these submitters regard themselves as being members of a newly formed past pupils group known as Nga Tauira Tawhito – Te Whanau o Hato Petera. This group of past pupils, who attended the College in the late 1990s and the early 2000s.
  - 3 submitters believed the College should be closed. 2 of these submitters had been victims of abuse.
  - 1 submitter felt that the current management of the College and the previous Board of Trustees are responsible for the demise of the school. They also felt that the Diocese did not act soon enough with regards to Statutory Intervention and that the appointment of the Commissioner in January 2018 occurred too late.
  - 1 submitter wished to lease the school facilities if the school was to close.
  - 1 submitter was concerned about ensuring that the intent of the Crown Grant was honoured and also the need to provide a whare kai as well as a whare Hui.
  - Only 1 submissions numbered were from people who made individual submissions during the 2016 consultation process.
  - 2 submissions were received from people who attended 2016 consultation Hui and one was a member of a group who made a submission in 2016.

- None of these submissions addressed the specific issues raised in the Consultation Document.

Consideration of Submissions to Keep Hato Petera Open

- 36 of the 43 submissions supported keeping Hato Petera College open as a boarding school albeit with only one proposal to resolve the concerns raised by the Proprietor.

- Common to all of these submission was their loyalty to the school. Many talked about the difference Hato Petera College had made to their lives; and for many the links of extended whanau to the College. However Hato Petera College today is not the same school it used to be. The history of the College will not make a school viable.

- All of these submission also stressed the need for Hato Petera College to revert to being a boarding school. However Hato Petera College is now a school for day students only and hostel facilities will not be provided in the future.

- All of the submissions supporting the continuation of Hato Petera as a boarding school are either not aware of and/or have not given due cognisance to the fact that the need for Māori boarding schools has changed. Indications are that significantly fewer Māori are choosing to send their rangatahi to Māori boarding schools for their secondary education. A likely explanation for this is that the secondary schools in rural areas or smaller towns are now a positive alternatives, focused on providing a quality education for their communities. Additionally there is now an increasing number of Māori schooling options. The 4 remaining Māori boarding schools in Aotearoa, all have very small school rolls and the total roll across all 4 schools is 531, the size of a small secondary school.

- The Proprietor is not in a position to provide hostel facilities and will not change his position on this due to a range of longstanding issues which escalated in 2015. Concerns included:
  - The Substandard condition of many of the kaingas: many could no longer meet Building Warrant of Fitness requirements.
- **Health and Safety and Security Issues:** There were concerns and difficulties associated with monitoring the whereabouts and well-being of students.

- **Hostel Staffing and Students:** Matua Atawhai were inappropriately trained and consequently unable to provide the appropriate care and support to address the diverse and serious needs of students.

- **Financial Viability:** There were ongoing financial viability issues.

- **Governance:** Current structure of the Trust was outdated and a lack of skilled people to accept governance roles.

- **Special Character:** The hostel has two fold responsibility of being Māori and Catholic. A large percentage of students were not of the Catholic faith. Staff were unable to support both aspects of Special Character.

- Despite the best efforts of Directors responsible for governance of the hostel, on the 20 September 2016 the Ministry of Education cancelled the hostel licence as a result of continuing concerns about the ability of the hostel management and staff to provide a safe environment for boarders. After giving due and serious consideration, to all of issues impacting on the functioning of the hostel the decision was made that the hostel would be closed permanently.

- A Supplementary Deed of Agreement officially changing the status of the College from a boarding school to a day only school was signed on 4 May 2017.

- **Only 1 submission offered a proposal regarding the continuation of the College. This came from the an individual who had previously indicated he was [S 9(2)(a)](https://example.com) However indications are that this submission was sent as an individual. The email concluded with the individual’s name followed by "Head Prefect of the College". It was not a letterhead. Additionally there was no indication that this submission or the ideas and suggestions detailed had been discussed with any other person or group or been formally accepted by [S 9(2)(a)](https://example.com) Key points were:

  - "Aiming to address the serious financial state of the College by working towards satisfying debt." This is a well-meaning but unrealistic statement.

  - "The College reverting to being a boarding school." An offer was made to inject the finances required provisional on the Whanau Committee forming a new Trust who would govern and manage the hostel. As explained above the College is now a school for day students only and the Proprietor will not change his position on this.

  - [S 9(2)(a)](https://example.com) would refresh the school curriculum and align this with the government's 100 Day Whanau Ora plan and re-establish affirmative structures to revitalise its academic and Tikanga platforms responsive to the 21st Century." Whilst this is an aspirational statement of intent it is not supported by any particulars or implementation capabilities. There has also been a failure to recognise that it is the Board of Trustees of a school, not the hostel governance body who determines curriculum priorities.

  - "Producing and executing a 3-5 month marketing plan with a long term target of 240 pupils within a 24 month timeframe." Marketing plans that have been promoted previously have been unsuccessful. The marketing plan lacks credibility and is unrealistic. The combined roll at 1 July 2017 of the other 4 Maori Boarding schools in New Zealand was 531 with only of these schools having a roll of just over 200.

  - "Reviewing Hato Petera's position in 12 months from 6th July 2018." Once again confusion about roles is evident and this proposal also lacks credibility.
5. ISSUES DETAILED FOR CONSIDERATION AND RESPONSES RECEIVED IN SUBMISSIONS

- **Low Student Enrolments**

  The College has a maximum roll of 245. Its roll peaked in 2009 at 148 students and has fallen since 2009 with a significant decrease in 2012 and then progressive roll decreases since 2014.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ROLL</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

  Numbers by Year Level (July 2017)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>Y9</th>
<th>Y10</th>
<th>Y11</th>
<th>Y12</th>
<th>Y13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NUMBER OF STUDENTS</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- By Term 3 2017 the roll had dropped to 11 students. At the start of the 2018 school year the roll was just 5 students and by the end of Term 1 2018 just one student remained on the roll.

- The low roll in the last few years not only reflects the low number of Māori secondary-aged students living on Auckland’s North Shore but also that many Catholic Māori are preferring to send their children to local state schools or local Catholic state integrated schools.

- As at 1 July 2017 Hato Petera College had a roll of 13 Māori students, some of whom lived on the North Shore. Carmel College had a Year 7-15 Māori roll of 49 and Rosmini College had a Year 7-15 Māori roll of 99. There were 66 Māori Year 1-6 students attending local State Integrated Catholic schools. A total of 1,076 Māori attend the other 14 Catholic secondary schools in Auckland².

- The role of Māori boarding schools has changed over time. Of the 13 Māori boarding schools established by the Anglican, Presbyterian and Catholic Churches in the late 1800s through to the mid-1900s:
  - 7 have closed.
  - 1 (i.e. Wesley College), changed to accept students of all ethnicities and now caters predominantly for Māori and Pacific Island students.
  - 5 continue to operate – 4 as boarding schools: an Anglican girls school, an Anglican boys school, a Catholic girls school, a Catholic boys school and Hato Petera College a Catholic co-educational school as a school for day students only.

- As at 1 July 2017 the rolls for the 4 Māori Boarding schools (excluding Hato Petera College) were 84, 111, 117 and 219 respectively giving a total roll of 531. This is the roll of one small secondary school.

- Indications are that significantly fewer Māori are choosing to send their rangatahi to Māori boarding schools for their secondary education. The likely explanation for this is that the secondary schools in

² Appendix II
rural areas or smaller towns are now a positive alternatives, focused on providing a quality education for their communities. Additionally there is now an increasing number of Māori schooling options.

- Given that the rolls of other Māori boarding schools it is plain that (as suggested by one submitter) a 3 to 6 month marketing plan for Hato Petera College as a boarding school to achieve a target of 240 students within a 24 month time period is not realistic or achievable. Additionally this is based on the premise that the school would revert to a boarding school which will not be the case.

- **Impact on the Curriculum:** The low roll significantly impacts on the range of subjects the College can offer. In 2017 classes were combined for subjects across more than one Year level and in 2018 the school would have been necessary to enrol Year 12 and 13 students with Te Aho o Te Kura Paunamu (The Correspondence School) to study English by correspondence.

- Even prior to 2017 it would appear that students at Hato Petera College had a limited choice of subjects either because of school requirements i.e. compulsory subjects or the lack of access to subjects that could be accessed through digital technologies.

- Providing students with opportunities to learn a diverse range of subjects especially at Years 11-13 – 30+ subjects in Years 12 and 13 is the norm in schools with rolls of 750 or greater and 20+ in the smaller of the 15 Catholic secondary schools in the Auckland Diocese compared to the 6 or 7 offered at Hato Petera College.

- The absence of a strong programme in Te Reo Māori is a noticeable aspect of Hato Petera College, a school steeped in Māori culture and history. Previously Māori performing arts was a significant part of the senior Te Reo programme. There was a noticeable absence of either Level 1 or Level 2 Māori medium provision.

- Only 1 submission made comment on the Curriculum with the statement:

  "We will refresh the school curriculum and align this with the government's 100 Day Whanau Ora plan and re-establish affirmative structures to revitalise its academic and Tikanga platforms responsive to the 21st Century."

- It would appear that this submitter believes that a group managing a hostel can determine the curriculum for the College. The fact that the Board of Trustees has responsibility for determining the emphasis and vision of curriculum delivery, after consulting with its community, does not appear to be understood.

- **Impact on Extra-Curricular Opportunities:** The range of co-curricular and extra-curricular sporting and cultural activities opportunities that can be provided for students has been severely curtailed. There have been insufficient students over the past few years to have sports or cultural teams/groups participating in interschool competitions. There has been no participation in any Kapa Haka competitions.

- Some of the submission from past pupils included examples of some extra-curricular they had participated in, but at this time they attended the school, Hato Petera College was a very different school to what it is today.

- Another submission said that extra-curricular programmes needed to be extended. This is not possible with a low roll number.
• **Impact on the Catholic Special Character of the College**: The ability of the College to provide for the holistic Catholic education of students has diminished. While karakia has remained strong at the school, other Catholic Character activities and initiatives such as retreats, involvement in sacramental programmes, social outreach and service activities and programmes and regular participation in the sacraments have not been possible.

• Prior to 2017 the school had not addressed identified breaches to the schools Integration Agreement.

• Some of the submissions from past pupils wrote about how Hato Petera had assisted their faith development and whilst this may have been the case in the past, it is currently not the position.

**Student Achievement and Implications for Progression to Tertiary Study**

• Prior to 2014 NCEA Level 1-3 student achievement data was above the national average for decile 3 schools, but was below the national average. The first table below, shows the number of students leaving with at least NCEA Level 1, 2 or 3 (2013-2016), with the second showing School Leavers with University Entrance.

| Hato Petera School Leavers with at least NCEA level 1-3 or equivalent (by Gender and Year) |
|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| LEVEL 1 | LEVEL 2 | LEVEL 3 OR ABOVE |
|---------|---------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| **FEMALE** | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 3 |
| **MALE** | 7 | 9 | 2 | 6 | 8 | 2 | 2 | 7 | 2 |
| **TOTAL** | 13 | 15 | 8 | 12 | 14 | 7 | 6 | 12 | 5 |
| **TOTAL %** | 92.9 | 83.3 | 57.1 | 85.7 | 77.8 | 50.0 | 42.9 | 66.7 | 35.7 |

| Hato Petera School Leavers with University Entrance (by Gender and Year) |
|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 |
| **FEMALE** | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| **MALE** | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| **TOTAL** | 5 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| **TOTAL %** | 16.1% | 6.7% | 0% | 0% | 20% |

• The very low percentage of students attaining University Entrance limits the ability of Hato Petera College students to move into some avenues of Tertiary Education. As can be seen from the table on the next page the percentage of students leaving the College and not entering into any type of Tertiary Education increased from 2013 to 2015.

| School Leavers progression to Tertiary Study |
|-----------------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| 2013 | 2014 | 2015 |
| **Female** | **Male** | **Female** | **Male** | **Female** | **Male** |
| No at Universities | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| No not in Tertiary Education | 6 | 9 | 2 | 5 | 2 | 9 |
| Total | 12 | 19 | 6 | 8 | 6 | 13 |
| % attending University | 9.68 | 28.57 | 10.53 |
| % Not in Tertiary Education | 48.39 | 50.00 | 57.89 |
- A few submitters stated they had attained national qualifications while during their time at Hato Petera College. No submission commented on the data or how achievement standards should be addressed.

**Financial Position**

- The College is in a very serious financial position. As is indicated in the table below the school has been in a position of negative equity since 2012. It is significant that the 2016 financial information is not available as the 2016 Annual accounts have still not been audited. Similarly the 2017 financial information is not yet available. However, in general resourcing is roll-based.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SURPLUS/(DEFICIT)</strong></td>
<td>(38,608)</td>
<td>31,529</td>
<td>47,531</td>
<td>(43,137)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WORKING CAPITAL</strong></td>
<td>(2,206)</td>
<td>5,566</td>
<td>(21,879)</td>
<td>(53,216)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CASH FUNDS</strong></td>
<td>(27,425)</td>
<td>21,343</td>
<td>109,553</td>
<td>48,973</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EQUITY</strong></td>
<td>(72,599)</td>
<td>(33,991)</td>
<td>(65,205)</td>
<td>(113,051)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SCHOOL ROLL</strong></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- One submission commented on the financial position of the College and believed that the Catholic Diocese of Auckland should take responsibility for the financial issues facing the school. Given that operational and staffing costs of an integrated school is the burden of the government, this submission does not advance matters.

- Another submitter believes that Te Whanau o Hato Petera directly contributed to significant debt and poor management of the kura. A third submitter made the statement that the site should be used "for the benefit of all New Zealanders e.g. site of training for unemployed youth or emergency housing. Those who wish school to continue are pushing their own agenda in the guise of helping one student."

- None of these submissions address the financial issues facing the College. The Proprietor’s view is that continual financial support for a school with one (and possibly up to four) students is not an effective use of government funding.

- In addition there still remains significant levels of Attendance Dues outstanding to the Proprietor. Attendance Dues are critical for operational costs such as compliance and for reinvestment in buildings and facilities, which are not the responsibility of the Crown. As at January 2018 outstanding Attendance Dues amounted to approximately $80,000.

**Governance**

- In March 2017, the Secretary of Education appointed an LSM to assist the Board fulfill their governance responsibilities. In this role the LSM assumed responsibility for the establishment of Board policies and procedures, financial operations, management of communications, and employment of staff.
• Because of ongoing governance issues two highly respected and experienced Bishop Appointees resigned from the Board of Trustees in August 2017. This means that the Proprietor was unable to be adequately represented on the board in respect of its Integration Agreement.

• In January 2018, following the confirmed ERO report of 26 October 2017, the Secretary of Education, appointed the LSM to the role of Commissioner and he replaced the Board of Trustees and assumed all their responsibilities.

• One submitter commented that the Catholic Diocese had not acted promptly enough to appoint a Commissioner. It is of course the Secretary of Education who makes this determination not the Proprietor.
6. CATHOLIC EDUCATION FOR MĀORI AS MĀORI

- It is the view of the Bishop that Catholic Māori can receive the education they deserve as Māori in the 15 other Catholic Secondary schools within the Diocese. As at the 1 July 2017 there were 1,166 Māori students attending these 15 Catholic Secondary schools in the Diocese.

- All of these 15 Catholic secondary schools are committed to providing a quality Catholic education for Catholic Māori as Catholic Māori. How this occurs is detailed below.

**Growth in Te Reo and Tikanga Facilitated by:**

- Each of our 15 Catholic secondary schools working in partnership with whanau to develop our students as Māori, both through Te Reo and tikanga.
- All 15 school offering Te Reo Māori in Years 7-10 (compulsory in some schools at Year 7 or in Year 7-9) and the majority of these schools offering and having classes in Te Reo to senior levels.
- Some schools extending those students who are fluent in Te Reo, or who have come through Kura Kaupapa total immersion primary schools by individual programmes or advancing level of Te Reo e.g. Year 9 students sitting NCEA Level 1 Te Reo.
- The use of Te Reo Māori greetings phrase and words are normal part of language in the schools and classrooms.
- Developing strong links with local iwi.
- Māori values and customs being incorporated into school life e.g. Tika, Pono and Aroha are common values across all schools with students understanding what this looks like both in their life at school and in society. Opportunities to welcome visitors with powhiri, annually celebrating Matariki.
- Offering a wide range of leadership opportunities; extra-curricular activities in sport, music, drama and cultural areas, including in most schools kapa haka and in some schools waka ama. Encouraging entries into Te Reo speech competitions such as APPA, Manu Korero, scripture reading at Pompallier Shield.
- Having marae visits and stays as a normal part of the school programme. Some examples include: Field trips to marae; Noho (overnight marae stays) for students; all of Year 9 spending 3 days on a marae and all of Year 13 spending 4 days on a marae; Year 9 trip to Hokianga to look at early church in NZ – Māori students as leaders.
- In some school having dual signage throughout the school.

**Governance Facilitated by:**

- All of the 15 schools and their Boards of Trustees having a growing focus on bicultural Aotearoa New Zealand; the principles of Te Tiriti o Waitangi and an understanding of tikanga Māori.
- The majority of our schools having Māori representation on the Boards of Trustees.
- Some schools having a Māori whanau group which provides support and guidance for families and the BOTT: One of our large Secondary boy's school has establishment of a Te Roopu Rangatira - whanau consultative committee which reports to the Board each month. This school had two Māori Board members with one having a specific portfolio on Māori advancement.
- Facilitates Hui for whanau and students.
- Committed to ensuring staff receive appropriate professional development. Some examples of professional development occurring in schools includes: the Te Mana programme for Provisional Registers Teachers; Māori Spirituality for Religious Education staff; Treaty of Waitangi obligations;
Marae protocol, including visit to a Marae; majority of staff at one school undertaking a 100 hour course on Te Reo Māori.

Catholic Special Character Facilitated by:

- All 15 schools being truly Catholic in all they do; ensuring that all practices, curriculum, policies and decisions are imbued with the school's Catholic Special Character.
- Facilitating students to encounter Christ; deepen their knowledge of Christ and Church teachings; and growth in their witness of their faith.
- Providing students with opportunities for a rich prayer and liturgical life including retreat opportunities.
- Students' active involvement in service and outreach programme recognising the need to reach out to those in need.
- Incorporating the use of himene and Te Reo in karakia, the Mass other liturgical celebrations and school assemblies.

Curriculum and Student Achievement Facilitated by:

- Including Māori spirituality in the Religious education programmes.
- Providing students with opportunities to learn a diverse range of subjects especially at Years 11-13 (30+ subjects in Years 12 and 13 is the norm in schools with rolls of 750 or greater and 20+ in the smaller of the 15 secondary schools compared to the 6 or 7 offered at Hato Petaera).
- All staff receiving professional development to be culturally responsive and incorporate our bi-cultural heritage into their classrooms.
- Māori topics being taught across curriculum especially Art, English, Health and Physical Education, History, Media Studies and Social Studies.
- Keeping students engaged in school and learning past the age of compulsory education².
- Emphasising the importance of academic excellence; students taking responsibility for their own leaning and becoming independent learners so that each student is able to attain personal standards of excellence. It is significant that the achievement of Māori students as evidenced in NCEA Level 1, Level 2 and Level 3 at the other 15 Catholic Secondary Schools in the Diocese is overall far superior to that of students at Hato Petaera College⁴. These schools are now focusing on raising the percentage of Māori students attaining endorsement in NCEA qualifications.
- Equipping Māori students to move into tertiary education. N.B. The percentage of Māori students transitioning from school into Degree (Level 7) courses, overall is far higher for Māori students attending the other 15 Catholic secondary schools. Also far less Māori students who have attended the other 15 secondary schools do not go on to some form of tertiary studies⁵.
- Connecting Māori students to programmes offered by tertiary institutions
- Most of the school having mentoring programmes for Māori students - Tuakana Teina and a few having their students linked to the University Māori mentoring programme – Katti.
- Career planning opens specialised pathways to Māori students which enable them to successfully undertake tertiary study.
- Equipping students with the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values that enables them to move confidently into tertiary pathways and become people who can make a valued contribution to their own communities and to society in general.

---

² Appendix III
³ Appendix IV
⁴ Appendix V
Pastoral Care

- All schools being safe and nurturing with excellent pastoral support services provided in culturally appropriate ways for Māori students.
- In some schools Māori students being able to be part of a Whānau Form class which helps to develop a deeper understanding of Te Ao Māori and their Te Reo.
- Some schools offering a Māori Homework Breakfast Club.

Leadership

- Promoting a variety of Leadership roles e.g. kaiawhina – particular to tikanga or leadership in Te Reo classes for Māori students with more advanced skills levels.
- Senior Māori students being acknowledged for the contribution they make to tikanga Māori and as leaders in their schools.
- Many schools having Korowai worn by Māori Cultural leader and/or Head Boy/Head Girl.
7. CONCLUSION

- For the reasons outlined above the Proprietor has serious concerns about the viability of Hato Petera College and requests that the Integration Agreement be cancelled with urgency.

- The education of students is being severely compromised. It is understood that there are 3 or possibly 4 students attending the school but their attendance is “spasmodic”. The lives of these students will be adversely impacted because of the inability of the school to provide them with an education they need and deserve.

- The position for the staff of the school is untenable. They are unable to undertake their professional responsibilities in a school environment which is stimulating and invigorating.

- The Proprietor has carefully considered all of the submissions received. None offer viable alternatives or address the issues impacting on Hato Petera College.

- Māori boarding schools once played a significant role in the education of Māori. However times have changed as indicated by the decline in demand for Māori boarding schools nationally. Māori are choosing from a variety of Māori educational options. Additionally secondary schools in rural area are now providing quality education for students in their communities.

- Hato Petera College is not the secondary school of choice for Catholic Māori, within the Catholic Diocese of Auckland. Past students have chosen not to send their children and grandchildren to Hato Petera College. More recently, the College has not been able to respond to the challenge of providing for the educational needs of the local community and the wider Catholic population in Auckland.

- The 15 Catholic secondary schools within the Catholic Diocese of Auckland are preferred options for Catholic Māori. We are confident they are able to provide education for Māori as Māori.

- The closure of Hato Petera would enable the facilities to be used by an alternative education provider. At this time the Diocese has no intention of selling the College.

- The Diocese is committed to ensuring that the intent of the Deed of Grant made in 1850 in relation to the land, is honoured and that the land, or income from the land will be used to support “... the education of our subjects of children of both races and of children of other poor and destitute persons being inhabitants of the islands of the Pacific...” (Deed of Grant, 19 August 1850)
APPENDIX I:  HATO PETERA COLLEGE and the 1850 CROWN GRANT

Bishop Patrick Dunn as the Bishop of the Catholic Diocese of Auckland is the Proprietor of Hato Peteria College. He is the owner of all the land associated with the property at 102 College Road Northcote pursuant to a Deed of Grant dated 19 August 1850 (Endowment). This property encompasses Hato Peteria College as well as land on the other side of the road from the College where the boarding hostel had been located.

When the Endowment was granted to him, Bishop Pompallier the Catholic Bishop at the time, became the fourth owner within the colonial legal system after the land had already passed out of Maori hands. Bishop Pompallier did not acquire the land from Maori.

The Endowment provided land for the maintenance and support of an existing school, the first St Mary’s College, which was located on an adjoining site already owned by the Bishop.

The Endowment was not specifically for Maori and is clear:

“Whereas a School has been established by the Government in the Parish of Takapuna in the suburbs of Auckland under the superintendence of the Bishop of the Roman Catholic Church at Auckland for the education of children of our subjects of both races and of children of other poor and destitute persons being inhabitants of the islands of the Pacific ..........”
## APPENDIX II: 1 JULY ROLL DATA CATHOLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN THE AUCKLAND DIOCESE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>2015 Māori</th>
<th>2015 All</th>
<th>2016 Māori</th>
<th>2016 All</th>
<th>2017 Māori</th>
<th>2017 All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baradene</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>1135</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>1149</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>1190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmel</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1026</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>1028</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>1093</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>De La Salle</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>999</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>983</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liston</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>801</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>811</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marcellin</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>586</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>582</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>526</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marist</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>747</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>744</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAuley</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>759</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>776</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pompallier</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>490</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>498</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosmini</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>1019</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>1061</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>1058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacred Heart</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>1219</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>1215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sancta Maria</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>993</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>987</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Dominic's</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>837</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>853</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Mary's</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>931</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>944</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Paul's</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Peter's</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>1312</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>1312</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>1303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,132</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,121</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,156</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,146</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,166</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,168</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Hato Petera    | 84 | 85 | 48 | 48 | 13 | 14 |
APPENDIX III: RETENTION RATES OF STUDENTS PAST THE AGE OF COMPULSORY EDUCATION IN CATHOLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN THE DIOCESE

Students stay at school beyond the compulsory age of attendance if they are they are engaged in their learning; feel safe and can recognise the value of the education they are receiving.

Students who leave school at an earlier age are less likely to attain the qualifications required to enter into tertiary training pathways such as Universities, Polytechnics, Wananga, or Private Training Establishments

As can be seen from the table below the retention rate of Māori students to at least 17 years of age is higher at other Catholic schools then at Hato Petera College.

% OF SCHOOL LEAVERS STAYING AT SCHOOL UNTIL AT LEAST THEIR 17TH BIRTHDAY (2014-2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Percentage staying until at least 17 years-old</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Māori</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARADENE</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARMEL</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE LA SALLE</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LISTON</td>
<td>71.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARCELLIN</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARIST</td>
<td>87.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAULEY</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POMPAULIER</td>
<td>76.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROSMINI</td>
<td>87.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACRED HEART</td>
<td>94.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANCTA MARIA</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST DOMICIC'S</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST MARY'S</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST PAUL'S</td>
<td>77.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST PETER'S</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEAN</td>
<td>85.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| HATO PETERA   | 76.6  | 76.6  | 72.2  | 73.7  | 64.3  | 64.3  |

N.B. The data taken from the "Education Counts" website.

x = data that has been suppressed where there are between 0 and 5 students in the denominator for a specific group.
APPENDIX IV: ACHIEVEMENT RATES IN NCEA LEVEL 1, LEVEL 2 AND LEVEL 3 AT THE SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN THE DIOCESE

The tables below show that Māori Students attending Catholic secondary schools, other than Hato Petera College are achieving better results in NCEA Level 1, 2 and 3 than Māori students attending Hato Petera College.

N.B. The data is taken from the “Education Counts” website.

x = data that has been suppressed where there are between 0 and 5 students in the denominator for a specific group.

TABLE 1: % SCHOOL LEAVERS WITH AT LEAST NCEA LEVEL 1 OR EQUIVALENT (2014-2016) FOR MĀORI AND ALL STUDENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>2014 Māori</th>
<th>2014 All</th>
<th>2015 Māori</th>
<th>2015 All</th>
<th>2016 Māori</th>
<th>2016 All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baradene</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>99.4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmel</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>98.6</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>De La Salle</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>88.3</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>92.7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>92.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liston</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>95.5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marcellin</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>93.9</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marist</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.3</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAuley</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>97.2</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>95.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pompallier</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.2</td>
<td>92.3</td>
<td>95.9</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>97.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosmini</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>96.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacred Heart</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>98.0</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>99.5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sancta Maria</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>99.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Dominic’s</td>
<td>92.3</td>
<td>95.1</td>
<td>90.9</td>
<td>96.1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Mary’s</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Paul’s</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.8</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>94.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Peter’s</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96.6</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.2</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>99.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>95.8</td>
<td>96.4</td>
<td>89.6</td>
<td>97.5</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>98.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The 15 other secondary schools have a significantly higher percentage of Māori students leaving school with a NCEA Level 1 as their minimum qualification than at Hato Petera College.

In 2014 the % of Māori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 1 was higher than only 3 of the other 15 schools.

In 2015 and 2016 % of Māori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 1 was lower than of all the other 15 schools.
### TABLE 2: % SCHOOL LEAVERS WITH AT LEAST NCEA LEVEL 2 OR EQUIVALENT (2014-2016) FOR MÄORI AND ALL STUDENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>2014 Mäori</th>
<th>2014 All</th>
<th>2015 Mäori</th>
<th>2015 All</th>
<th>2016 Mäori</th>
<th>2016 All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BARADENE</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>99.4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CARMEL</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>97.9</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE LA SALLE</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>80.4</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>86.8</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LISTON</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td>89.3</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>97.6</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARCELLIN</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>82.2</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>87.9</td>
<td>81.8</td>
<td>88.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARIST</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.3</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>98.1</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>95.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAuley</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>92.4</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>93.5</td>
<td>90.9</td>
<td>89.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PomPallier</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>88.7</td>
<td>84.6</td>
<td>93.2</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>96.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosmini</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96.1</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacred Heart</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>96.5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.6</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sancta Maria</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>95.2</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>96.4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Dominics</td>
<td>92.3</td>
<td>93.2</td>
<td>81.8</td>
<td>91.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>97.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Mary's</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>95.5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Paul's</td>
<td>77.8</td>
<td>84.8</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>90.6</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>95.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Peter's</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>93.1</td>
<td>81.8</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>92.3</td>
<td>97.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
<td>83.2</td>
<td>92.3</td>
<td>81.6</td>
<td>94.6</td>
<td>92.2</td>
<td>94.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Hato Petera**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hato Petera</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>77.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall the 15 other Catholic secondary schools have a significantly higher percentage of Mäori students leaving school with a NCEA Level 2 or higher qualification than at Hato Petera College.

In 2014 the % of Mäori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 2 was higher than 5 of the other 15 schools.

In 2015 the % of Mäori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 2 was higher than only 2 of the other 15 schools.

In 2016 the % of Mäori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 2 was significantly lower than all the other 15 schools.
### Table 3: % School Leavers with at Least NCEA Level 3 or Equivalent (2014-2016) for Māori and All Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>2014 Māori</th>
<th>2015 Māori</th>
<th>2016 Māori</th>
<th>2014 All</th>
<th>2015 All</th>
<th>2016 All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baradene</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>94.9</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>93.5</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>96.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carmel</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>92.5</td>
<td>81.3</td>
<td>85.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>De La Salle</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>40.5</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>52.3</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>42.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liston</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>88.8</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>71.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marcellin</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>63.6</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>62.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marist</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>90.5</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>90.3</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>85.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McAuley</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>84.7</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>77.1</td>
<td>90.9</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pompallier</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>53.8</td>
<td>71.2</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>71.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosmini</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>78.7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacred Heart</td>
<td>82.4</td>
<td>88.5</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>85.4</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>87.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sancta Maria</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>81.6</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>87.1</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Dominic's</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>63.6</td>
<td>74.8</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Mary's</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>93.8</td>
<td>88.9</td>
<td>88.5</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>88.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Paul's</td>
<td>44.4</td>
<td>54.3</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>64.2</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>71.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Peter's</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>78.6</td>
<td>54.5</td>
<td>81.5</td>
<td>92.3</td>
<td>92.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>68.3</td>
<td>77.4</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>80.6</td>
<td>72.4</td>
<td>79.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Hato Petera**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2014 Māori</th>
<th>2014 All</th>
<th>2015 Māori</th>
<th>2015 All</th>
<th>2016 Māori</th>
<th>2016 All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>42.9</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall the 15 other Catholic secondary schools have a significantly higher percentage of Māori students leaving school with a NCEA Level 3 or higher qualification than at Hato Petera College.

In 2014 the % of Māori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 3 was higher than only 1 of the other 15 schools.

In 2015 the % of Māori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 3 was higher than 7 of the other 15 schools.

In 2016 the % of Māori leaving Hato Petera College with at least NCEA Level 3 was significantly lower than all but 1 the other 15 schools.
APPENDIX V: PARTICIPATION RATES IN TERTIARY STUDIES FOR STUDENTS LEAVING CATHOLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN THE DIOCESE

% SCHOOL LEAVERS ENROLLED IN DEGREE COURSES AND THOSE NOT ENROLLED TERTIARY EDUCATION ONE YEAR AFTER LEAVING SCHOOL (2013-2015) LEAVER COHORTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</th>
<th>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>BARADENE</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>73.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>10.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CARMEL</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>41.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>33.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DE LA SALLE</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>20.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>43.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LISTON</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>40.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>20.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MARCELLIN</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>38.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>34.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MARIST</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>75.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>17.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>McAULEY</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>44.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>21.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>POMPALLIER</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>39.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>26.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ROSMINI</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>64.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>66.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SACRED HEART</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SANCTA MARIA</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>22.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ST DOMINICS</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>12.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ST MARY'S</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>63.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>18.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ST PAUL'S</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ST PETER'S</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>28.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>14.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MEAN</strong></td>
<td>Enrolled Degree L7 or above</td>
<td>39.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Enrolled in Tertiary</td>
<td>25.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
N.B. The data is taken from the “Education Counts” website.

x = data that has been suppressed where there are between 0 and 5 students in the denominator for a specific group.

A much greater percentage of Māori students attending the other 15 Catholic secondary schools in the Diocese transition to Degree (Level 7) courses after leaving school than the percentage from Hato Petera College.

Close to 50% of Hato Petera College students do not go onto any tertiary education after leaving school. This figure is much lower for Māori students attending the other 15 Catholic secondary schools in the Diocese.
Annex 2: Other submissions
10/5/2018  
Kate Styles  
National Director  
Educational Access  
Ministry of Education  
Wellington  

Tena koe Kate,  

RE: -The possible cancellation of the integration agreement of Hato Petera College. 
Submission made by the Commissioner of Hato Petera College Lex Hamill.

When preparing a submission to consider the possible cancellation of the integration agreement of Hato Petera College I was conscious of the echoes of the past and what the school represented to many of the old boys, old girls and whanau who knew the College intimately. Most who have presented a point of view to the Commissioner over recent times spoke about the merits and successes of the College in years gone by.

Reflections expressed were grounded in a time when there was a student roll greater than 100 students. Advocates described a culturally rich rigorous teaching and learning program that included options such as accounting, history, chemistry and physics. Participation in school life during this time gave student’s opportunities for life-long learning. The College’s corridors and fields resonated to the sound of students fully engaged in an active productive life in a College they took pride in.

The College and pervading culture these supporters spoke of no longer exists; it is a memory formed in the minds of pupils etched at a formative time of their lives. While past pupils still retain pride in the school they attended the institution that exits today is but a shadow of its former self.

This paper describes the Hato Petera College that exists today along with the Commissioners professional opinion on the school’s sustainability and status of the integration agreement. This submission is presented under the headings of operational costs and financial sustainability, curriculum delivery, property, staff morale and the colleges place in the educational network.

Operational costs and financial sustainability: -As of the time of writing this submission the College recorded a student roll number of one and a GMFS of 4.1 FTTE’s. Every quarter the school receives approximately $50,000 of operational funding or $200,000 per annum. Although paid through Wellington teaching staff salaries for the four teachers employed cost in the order of $350,000 per annum. To remain operational, while providing an education for the one student enrolled, will cost the New Zealand tax payer approximately $550,000 for the 2018 school year.
Recent practice saw more than 80% of operational funding being budgeted to support the employment of support staff with less than 1% allocated to curriculum delivery. Since the Commissioners involvement support staff have been redeployed and the curriculum budget increased.

However, there are long-term contracts with the likes of program maintenance services that consume fifteen percent of the current budget. The school will have to manage these costs. To terminate this contract for example will cost as much in penalty costs as it will to continue payment. Unfortunately, current payments being made are for work already completed so the $30,000 still owing will do nothing to improve the look of the property or its street appeal to the parents in the neighbourhood.

Operational funding for a school is contingent on student roll numbers. There is a strong likelihood that the roll of Hato Petera College at the time of the July the 1st 2018 return will be zero. The College has a negative working capital which will increase during the 2018 school year. Currently there are two supernumerary staff being paid over entitlement because of employment practices supported by the previous Board of Trustees. By the end of the 2018 school year the financial position of the College will worsen because of a legacy of questionable decision making.

For the College to stay open there would need to be a significant cash injection made by the Ministry of Education to cover existing and future debts along with contingent liabilities that remain since the time the school had an operational hostel.

Curriculum Delivery: - Currently there are four teaching staff employed at Hato Petera College. These staff include the Principal, a Deputy Principal, a teacher of science along with a teacher of art. All teachers are permanent full-time registered employees.

With only one student the school has a timetable as opposed to a curriculum plan. Any teaching and learning program delivered today is constrained by what the teachers can teach as opposed to the preferred options or needs of the student/s.

At present the qualification mix of the teaching staff can support a defendable year 9 or 10 program. Should a year 11 student enrol at the College there is no one amongst the current staff that could teach literacy at level one and beyond. Such programs would have to be taught through Te Kura or virtual learning opportunities.

With only one student on the roll the teaching and learning programs on offer are short term and of an ad hoc nature. Teachers cannot do any long-term planning as they are unsure of how long each student will remain on the roll.

With one student on the roll each teacher has approximately 1.5 hours of student contact time every day. Of real concern to the Commissioner is the social interaction and engagement opportunities for the one student enrolled. This student has one-on-one tuition. In the
Commissioners opinion the classroom environment he has witnessed during recent times is sterile, lonely and soulless despite the best intentions of the staff.

**Property:** - Being of special character the property ownership resides with the Proprietor, the Catholic Church. Management of the school property however is the responsibility of the Board of Trustees. This responsibility is supported by operational grant funding, 5YA funding and 10-year property planning.

A passer-by would most likely describe the school as being in a state of disrepair. There is little street front appeal, the grounds are scruffy and dishevelled and the classrooms and hallways have the musty smell of mould, decay and neglect. However, there are some classrooms such as the science laboratory that have been renovated and still present a fresh persona.

Why has the property been allowed to deteriorate to what it looks like today? Some critics argue that it is because the Catholic Church has not invested in the school as it should have. As an educator I know that property should represent approximately 30% of the school’s budget, that is 30% of operational funding. Included in a school budget should be provision for depreciation and cyclical maintenance over and above contracts with the likes of property maintenance services.

Having analysed recent budgets ratified by the Board of Trustees of Hato Petera College it is obvious that little or no money was set aside for property other than security, cleaning, rubbish removal and minor repairs and maintenance. The Board elected to balance their books on an annual basis by redirecting the money received to bolster support staff salaries and operational costs that were not sustainable because of a declining roll. Over time the lack of investment in property and maintenance of grounds has compromised the school’s street appeal as well as reinforcing to the students enrolled that this is a poor school as evidenced in the students teaching and learning environment.

The Commissioner could not attest that the school has sufficient ability to address any health and safety concerns that have emerged because of limited resource and very expensive repairs and maintenance needs.

For Hato Petera College to remain open will require the Catholic Church to invest significantly in the property to address the outstanding issues and improve the street appeal to attract students back to the fold.

**Staff morale:** - Over recent times the atmosphere pervading the College staffroom is one of uncertainty, concern, and professional boredom. All staff are worried about their futures and want certainty in their life as professionals and income creators for their families. The Commissioner has been advised by staff that they would like the College closed and would encourage those making the decision to expedite the decision-making process as soon as possible. The Commissioner shares this opinion.
Hato Petera College’s place in the educational network:- During this consultation phase it is with wry interest that the Commissioner has observed that old boys, whanau and media alike talk about Hato Petera Māori Boys Boarding School in the same breath that they talk about Hato Petera College. Much of the comment made by supporters or reference to what the school was like is of a time when Hato Petera Māori Boys Boarding School existed.

Since the days of Hato Petera Māori Boys Boarding School the school has been re-designated to become a co-educational boarding school and in 2017 to a co-educational special character day-school. The school this consultation process is focused on is a co-education special character day school, not the single sex boarding school of yester year. Therefore, the question needs to be asked where does this co-educational day school sit in the network or more importantly what is the perception of the local community of what the school represents.

The Commissioner undertook an exercise to gauge what the community thought of the school. The sample size of the audience interviewed can easily be questioned and of course the evidence gathered is only anecdotal at best. During the week around lunch time at the Northcote Shopping Centre the Commissioner stopped and talked to those willing to engage and asked what their perception was of Hato Petera College.

All of those interviewed said it was ‘a Māori School’. When questioned further none of the interviewees would consider sending their children to Hato Petera College because it wasn’t even seen as an option when compared to Rosmini or Carmel College. For Hato Petera College to compete with the likes of Rosmini and Carmel it would have to rebrand and be marketed as a viable schooling option. Today the name Hato Petera College is synonymous with the education of Māori first and foremost with the special character of the school a distant second in the eyes of the community.

Summary

It is in the Commissioner’s professional opinion that Hato Petera College is not sustainable for the reasons articulated above. In my professional capacity as Commissioner I believe the integration agreement of Hato Petera College should be cancelled.

I thank you for considering this submission

Ngaa mihi

Lex Hamill

Commissioner of Hato Petera College.
10 April 2018

Kate Styles
National Director
Education Access
Sector Enrolment and Support.

Dear Kate

Hato Petera College

Thank you for the opportunity to comment to the Minister on the consultation relating to the possible closure of Hato Petera College. APIS supports the Proprietor’s request to cancel the agreement under section 430 of the Education Act 1989. The Proprietor has sought the support of other Ministers in the past to make this happen and has been concerned at the cost to the state of the delays involved in coming to this point.

The Proprietor values Hato Petera and its traditional support for Māori. In earlier years the school had a proud tradition of supporting Māori but in recent years the whanau have not accessed the College for their mokopuna. Catholic Māori in Auckland seek to be enrolled in the other Catholic Colleges and the academic success of those schools is much stronger than Hato Petera. The Proprietor has tracked the progress of Māori students in his network closely and will continue to support and welcome Māori into the wider network of Catholic Colleges. All students remaining in the College were offered places in existing schools despite competition and zoning for these places.

APIS encourages the Minister to cancel the integration agreement and to allow the Proprietor to demonstrate his commitment to Māori through the rest of his network.

s 9(2)(a)

Paul Ferris QSM
Chief Executive Officer
10 April 2018

Philippa Pidd
Manager Education Network
Ministry of Education
Box 1666
Wellington 6140

By email: Philippa.pidd@education.govt.nz

Kia ora Philippa

Possible cancellation of integration agreement of Hato Petera College

NZEI Te Riu Roa understands that discussions re the validity of this school have taken place over a long period.

The notification that a decision to cancel the integration agreement is imminent is welcomed by this organisation.

Ngā mihi

Lynda Stuart
Te Manukura | National President
From: Lorraine Kerr
Sent: Monday, 9 April 2018 4:57 p.m.
To: Shane Coleman
Subject: RE: Consultation for Hato Petera

Thanks Shane
I have no objections to the cancellation of the integrated status of Hato Petera
Take care,
Lorraine Kerr MNZM
President

New Zealand School Trustees Association
Level 8 – 142 Lambton Quay
PO Box 5123, Lambton Quay
Wellington 6140

Email: [Redacted]
DDI: [Redacted]

---

From: Shane Coleman
Sent: Monday, 9 April 2018 4:39 PM
To: Lorraine Kerr
Subject: Consultation for Hato Petera

Kia ora Lorraine

Please find attached a letter from Kate Styles regarding consultation on the possible cancelation of the integration agreement of Hato Petera College.

Ngā mihi

Shane
We get the job done  Ka e ti i a mātou nga mahi
We are respectful, we listen, we learn  He rōpū manaakii, he rōpū whakarongo, he rōpū ako mātou
We back ourselves and others to win  Ka manawatu ki a mātou, me tahi ake kia wāhitoria
We work together for maximum impact  Ka mahi ngātahi mō te tukanga hui tonu

Great results are our bottom line  Ko nga huianga tino pai a mātou whānga mutunga

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
TE AROHUNUI O TE MATAURANGA
Hi Chris,

In light of matters before the consultation process Over 12,000 expressions from members of the public stand in support of Stephanie Pomare, the only student standing. See link to the video below.

Hato Petera College has so much History and Potential for Maori Rangatahi if the right people are appointed to govern. We want it revitalised and do not wish for closure

12,000 reactions to keep Hato Petera Open
https://www.facebook.com/maraetv/posts/1613299995415116

Kind Regards,
Hi,

In light of matters before the consultation process we wish to inform you that over 379,000 expression views from members of the public stand in support of Stephanie Pomare, the only student standing. See link to the video below.

Hato Petera College has so much History and Potential for Maori Rangatahi if the right people are appointed to govern. We want it revitalised and do not wish for closure.

12,000 reactions to keep Hato Petera Open and 6,200 Public Shares plus 379,000+ views
https://www.facebook.com/maraetv/posts/1613299995415116
#WATCH Hato Petera college was celebrating its 90th year this year empty except for one brave soul. A girl attends the school and she wants people out there listen to help save the school.
Tena Koe Kelvin.

Ko wai au?
Ko Taiao te Maunga
Wheeru te Tangata
Ruanui te Tupuna
Taiao te Marae
Te Wahapu o Whangape
Te Uri O Tai nga Taatai Whakaheke
Te Kai Nga Mataa Te Hapu
Te Aoupouri Te iwi
Ko Nick Adams Taku Matua
Ko Char Adams Taku Whaea
Ko Watene Atama Taku Tungane
Ko Iriaka Adams Taku Ingoa

I grew up in Broadwood and Pawarenga, some may say the heart of Hokianga, done 80% of my schooling in the far north where my father was a social worker in Kaitaia and mother teaching at Broadwood Area School, they finally let me move away to Hato Petera College where I finished the rest of my senior years.

As you may have already seen all the publicity we have been getting at HPC, we had a hui on Sunday and the turnout was great, we came together, thought of solutions to keep our kura and our history alive.

We are on a mission to get 40 students enrolled at Hato Petera College within the next 20 days with the high hopes that it will keep our kura alive.

Since Sunday night we have had an overwhelming amount of interest come flooding in, with well over 1,000 shares on facebook and over 600 parents asking for enrolment forms to join us and learn the special character of our Maori Catholic Kura. I write this to you today asking on behalf of all my Whanau and Friends for your help.

If there is anything that you can assist us with we will be more than grateful.

I hope to Hear from you soon.
Kia ora e te Minita

My name is  and I attended Hato Petera College 1973-1977, ending as , as well as other titles. I have for the last 18 years been to avert further failure and provide a positive outcome for our Maori students in Currently we have 150 students in a total immersion reo Maori, tikanga Maori based operation that is exceedingly successful.

I apologise for my late submission but have been overseas.

Minister, please heed my advice.

What Maori need is not mainstream, but innovation and creativity that is borne and bred in their Maoritanga. What we need is more independence and control not church based indoctrination. What we need is ownership and empowerment the rebuilding of Maori identity and self faith as a leaping place into successful fulfillment in the wider world. Maori have heaps to offer but on their terms from their base. Sir, what we need are more opportunities not less, more support to find our directions for our young and potential leadership.

Minister, I submit that while some of the Church's histories and examples are inspirational, that the Church should be allowed to leave. Instead a faith in achievement and success be bred. I submit that investigations be started into a radical need based design with high achievement goals in targeted areas. This could be Leadership & Politics, Creativity and Innovation, Services, Sports & Leisure, Health & Science etc. Also that delivery be born from freedom not compliance and whanau is predominant.

Auckland not only has a high Maori population but has too huge opportunities to develop alliances with business, digital capacities, sport & science, further training, communications. Maori should be given the chance to grow and develop these roles in their culture.

The school could be named "Te Kamaka" (the Rock) which maintains a link to Hato Petera (St Peter).

Minister, I am completely available to talk to this submission, or provide a role you may see fit.
Kia ora mai Naaku iti nei 

9(2)(a)
For draft reply

From: s 9(2)(a)
Sent: Thursday, 17 May 2018 10:23 AM
To: s 9(2)(a)
Subject: FW: Hato peteria college

Kia ora s 9(2)(a)

Will you accept this transfer?

Regards

Sent with BlackBerry Work
(www.blackberry.com)

From: K Davis (MIN) <k.davis@ministers.govt.nz>
Date: Thursday, 17 May 2018, 10:21 AM
To: s 9(2)(a)
Subject: FW: Hato peteria college

Please see correspondence below.

Kind regards,

Roving Private Secretary (Administration)
Office of Hon Kelvin Davis
Minister of Corrections
Minister for Crown/Māori Relations
Minister of Tourism
Associate Minister of Education (Māori Education)

Parliamentary Service Te Ratonga Whare Pāremata
Private Bag 18041, Wellington 6160, New Zealand
www.parliament.nz

---- Original Message ----
From: s 9(2)(a)
Sent: Wednesday, 16 May 2018 2:46 PM
To: K Davis (MIN) <k.davis@ministers.govt.nz>
Subject: Hato peteria college

Tena koe Kelvin.
I'm writing this email in the hope that you can intervene in what is the destruction of our much loved kura. Someone in a position of influence needs to pull the bishop up and remind him of his obligations to our kura and our people. We are now going through yet another consultation review and my question is why bother? The findings from the last one were completely ignored by the church and the hostel was boarded up the day after Hekia voiced her support of the kura remaining...
Each time the whanau are asked to put forward their submissions for consultation we lose numbers not because whanau don’t care but because it has gotten us nowhere. In 2013 Hato peteria was thriving and our numbers were growing by 40 to 60 tauira a year and all the damage has been done by representatives of the bishop. Arohamai the ministry of education through s9(2)(a) have sat on their hands when they could have made a huge difference. Enough is enough. It’s time to do something before it’s too late.

I understand there was a conflict of interest with s9(2)(a) However I believe that is no longer relevant as the whanau trust is no more.

Neea Mihi
s 9(2)(a)