

Security Classification Budget Sensitive

Office of the Minister of Education

Cabinet

## **Addressing teacher supply**

### **Proposal**

- 1 This paper seeks Cabinet's agreement to a package of initiatives to address current pressures on teacher supply. The cost of the package is estimated at approximately \$9.500m.
- 2 This paper also seeks Cabinet's agreement to reprioritise funds from Vote Education and Vote Social Development, and underspends in existing initial teacher education programmes in Vote Tertiary Education to contribute to the cost of the package.

### **Executive Summary**

- 3 There is increasing pressure on teacher supply in certain locations, subjects and parts of the sector. This includes the Auckland region and in specific subjects like te reo Māori, science, technology and mathematics and issues with the retention of beginning teachers. Tightening supply conditions are being exacerbated by falling initial teacher education (ITE) enrolments and high attrition rates for beginning teachers not employed in full time, permanent positions.
- 4 This Government has made a commitment to implement a comprehensive teacher supply programme. This paper is the first step in doing this and sets out my proposal to address the immediate and urgent pressures that principals are facing in recruiting the staff they need for the 2018 and 2019 school years.
- 5 To address pressure on teacher supply in the Auckland region, I propose to expand the Auckland Beginning Teacher Project by 20 places in 2018 and expand the Teach First NZ programme by 35 places in 2019.
- 6 I propose expanding the Voluntary Bonding Scheme (VBS), which is a recruitment tool for principals in attracting graduates to work in their schools, to:
  - 6.1 graduate teachers in decile two and three Auckland state and state-integrated schools
  - 6.2 graduate teachers of science, technology, maths, te reo Māori and all teachers in Māori medium settings nationally.
- 7 To address the immediate need of principals to recruit teachers for the 2018 school year and to maintain the advantage that decile one schools gain from the scheme, I will be limiting this expansion to only the first payment (\$10,500) which teachers can apply for in 2021 after their third year of teaching.
- 8 I also propose to cover the cost of the Teacher Education Refresher course (TER) for all teachers for the first six months of 2018 whose provisional teaching certification is due to or has already expired. This will remove the cost barrier associated with undertaking the course and address the immediate need to attract lapsed teachers back to the profession for 2018.
- 9 To mitigate the risk of schools being unable to identify a registered teacher to fill a needed position I will establish a fund of \$1m in financial year 2017/18 only to support schools' use of recruitment, retention and responsibility (3R) allowances when employing teachers on a Limited Authority to Teach (LAT).
- 10 The Ministry of Education, New Zealand Qualification Authority (NZQA), the Education Council and Immigration New Zealand have developed a fast-track process for overseas teachers in

specific countries that meet the criteria to teach in New Zealand. I intend to announce this new process as part of this package.

- 11 Some Auckland principals have raised a concern that current immigration policy settings, particularly in relation to the points system, work against Auckland schools being able to hire teachers from overseas. I propose that the Minister of Immigration and I instruct the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment to assess whether there are excessive barriers to overseas teachers being approved to work in New Zealand and, if so, how these could be addressed. Officials would be expected to report to Ministers with this advice by June 2018.
- 12 Te Aho o Te Kura Pounamu (Te Kura) is a further option that School Boards can access to supplement specialist learning. The Ministry and Te Kura will work together to ensure that School Boards are aware of the opportunity that the Emergency Staffing Scheme represents, particularly when schools are unable to recruit registered teachers with the specialist skills they need.
- 13 To support this package, I will also be funding a highly targeted marketing campaign increase enrolments into Initial Teacher Education (ITE), reengage teachers who have left teaching, and support principals with recruitment.
- 14 I have identified three areas of expenditure to be reprioritised to meet the cost of this package.

## **Background**

- 15 This Government campaigned on the following policies around teacher supply:
  - 15.1 Implement a comprehensive teacher supply programme to ensure that we have enough teachers to meet demand.
  - 15.2 Increase the availability of bonded scholarships in areas of identified teaching shortages, including science, maths, te reo Māori and in specific locations.
  - 15.3 Immediately instigate a review of teacher supply policy relating to Auckland in consultation with those in the profession.
  - 15.4 Investigate voluntary bonding arrangements whereby graduates can have some or all of their loan written-off in exchange for work in the public sector or in areas of critical skill shortage, particularly in teaching and nursing.
  - 15.5 Provide free TER courses for teachers returning to teaching or whose registration has otherwise lapsed, including those returning from maternity or parental leave.
  - 15.6 Fund a dedicated, positive public relations programme to promote teaching as a profession to school leavers and university graduates.
- 16 This paper represents my first steps in following through with these commitments.
- 17 In addition, the Ministry, the Education Council and the NZQA, along with Immigration New Zealand, have developed a set of pre-approved teaching qualifications and fast-track process for these qualifications. This change will mean that overseas teachers with these qualifications from the United Kingdom, Ireland, Canada and Fiji will complete the NZQA process at no cost, with both qualification and teacher registration processes completed within 10 days. I will announce this fast-track process as part of this package.
- 18 In the medium-term, the Ministry of Education is developing an overarching education workforce strategy that will fill a gap in strategic direction-setting for the system.

## **We are seeing increased pressure on teacher supply, particularly in Auckland**

- 19 Supply and demand is a complex area and it is difficult to manage and predict. In addition, there are some limitations on the data about the supply of and demand for teachers and I have concerns about the quality of some data sources. The Ministry of Education is currently working to strengthen and improve insight into the workforce, including through external validation of

Ministry data sets and creation of new and more meaningful data including across the education sector.

- 20 Nationally, we are seeing a 'mini baby-boom' moving through the schooling sector as population grows. We expect supply pressure to continue to grow in the primary sector next year, before moving into the secondary sector from 2019.
- 21 The supply of teachers is tightening in certain locations, subjects and parts of the sector. This includes Auckland, some specific subjects like te reo Māori (in both English and Māori medium education settings) and science, technology and mathematics related subjects. The pipeline for teachers to enter Māori medium is also a challenge.
- 22 Principals report that the pressures on teacher supply constrain their ability to appoint teachers able to meet the needs of diverse learners, particularly teachers with the ability to provide culturally responsive teaching practices. A shortage of te reo Māori teachers limits the system's ability to support the identity, language and culture of Māori students in all education settings. Furthermore, difficulties with recruitment and retention in the Māori medium sector restrict parental options for their children to learn through the Māori language.
- 23 Overall retention rates in the teaching workforce are high across the country, including in Auckland. However, the retention of newly graduated teachers who are not employed in permanent roles is much lower than for other teachers, with around 45-50% of these beginning teachers leaving the profession within the first five years of their career.
- 24 As with New Zealand's workforce as a whole, the teaching workforce is getting older – 20% of teachers are now over 60 years of age and a further 22% are aged 50-59. These teachers bring rich professional experience, but this trend will become challenging as increasing numbers of teachers that may retire in coming years.
- 25 Tertiary education enrolments have been falling over recent years and enrolments in ITE are following the same pattern – ITE enrolments decreased by 39% between 2011 and 2016. As a result, fewer new teachers are graduating each year.

#### *What I hear from the profession*

- 26 Principals have reported difficulty filling vacancies and retaining teachers in Auckland schools. Principals regularly report to the Ministry their concerns over the quality of graduate teachers. Graduates are often reported to be considered a second option, with principals preferring to employ experienced teachers. Principals indicate that variable ITE quality, fluctuating rolls and lack of multi-year funding of further staffing entitlement are reasons for not hiring beginning teachers into full-time permanent rolls. As noted above, this has an impact on the retention of newly trained teachers in the profession, may deter people from choosing teaching as a career, and will increase the pressure on teacher supply.
- 27 If prospective teaching candidates do not see teaching as providing viable, interesting, long-term career pathways, this is likely to impact on the supply of well qualified graduates coming into the profession.
- 28 Principals and sector groups have a pivotal role in promoting teaching as an attractive and rewarding career. The current narrative about teaching is likely to have a negative effect on the status of the profession. I expect that work with the profession through this package and my broader work programme to promote a positive picture about teaching as a career and grow the teaching profession.

#### **Initiatives to address immediate supply pressures**

- 29 To address the pressures currently being experienced I propose a package of support to be implemented and announced this year so that schools can access them from term one 2018. This includes:
  - 29.1 Expanding the Auckland Beginning Teacher Project by 20 places in 2018.

- 29.2 Expanding the Teach First NZ programme by 35 places in 2019.
- 29.3 Covering the cost of the TER for the first six months of 2018.
- 29.4 Extending eligibility for the first VBS payment (\$10,500) for teachers starting work in 2018 only to:
  - 29.4.1 graduate teachers working in decile two and three state and state-integrated schools in Auckland
  - 29.4.2 graduate teachers of science, technology, maths, te reo Māori and all teachers in Māori medium settings nationally.
- 29.5 Improving to the process for overseas teachers to come and teach here, including reducing the time and cost, provided they meet the criteria.
- 29.6 Establishing a fund in financial year 2017/18 to support schools' use of recruitment, retention and responsibility (3R) allowances when employing teachers on a Limited Authority to Teach (LAT) because they have been unable to recruit a registered teacher with the appropriate skills.
- 29.7 Increasing visibility of the Te Kura Emergency Staffing Vacancy scheme, for schools who are unable to recruit a suitable qualified teacher.
- 29.8 Funding a highly targeted marketing campaign to support the initiatives in this package.

#### *Expanding the Beginning Teacher Project*

- 30 The Auckland Beginning Teacher Project began in 2017. The project aims to increase the employment of beginning teachers in permanent or fixed-term roles in Auckland primary schools and to support them through to full certification.
- 31 Participating schools receive half of a beginning teacher's salary in cash (\$24,000), to support the induction and mentoring provided to the beginning teacher from the start of the year. In turn, schools offer beginning teachers full time employment for two years or more, which should enable the beginning teacher to obtain full certification.
- 32 Forty places in this programme are funded for 2018. I propose expanding the 2018 cohort by an additional 20 places, at a one-off cost of \$0.480m.

#### *Expanding the Teach First NZ Programme*

- 33 The Teach First NZ programme supports students to undertake employment based ITE in low decile secondary schools. Students work 0.6FTTE while they study, and are paid another 0.2FTTE by the government.
- 34 The next Teach First NZ cohort will begin teaching in 2018, with the final cohort starting teaching in 2019. Teach First NZ has been successful at recruiting high-quality teachers, including a significant proportion of Māori and Pasifika teachers and teachers in shortage subject areas.<sup>1</sup> Participants are primarily employed in secondary schools in Auckland, with some employed in Northland, Waikato and the Bay of Plenty.
- 35 Because participants work as teachers in secondary schools from the start of their training, Teach First NZ is an effective way to get well qualified trainee teachers working in schools straight away, particularly in shortage subjects.
- 36 It is not possible to extend the 2018 cohort as all places have been filled and participants have begun their pre-employment intensive training programme. However, I propose that we expand the 2019 cohort by 35 places at a one off cost of \$2.034.

---

<sup>1</sup> 17% of the 2018 cohort are Māori and 20% are Pasifika. 55% are in STM subjects and 15% are in te reo Māori.

### *Expanding the Voluntary Bonding Scheme*

- 37 The VBS is a recruitment tool for principals to use in attracting graduate teachers into their school. The scheme has been in place since 2009 and provides payments to graduate teachers in their first five years of teaching in an eligible school, with payments made in the teachers third (\$10,500), fourth (\$3,500) and fifth (\$3,500) year teaching. Payments are initially made against the teacher's student loan, but are provided to the teacher in cash should they not have a student loan.
- 38 Currently, eligibility is limited to decile one or severely isolated state and state-integrated schools.
- 39 I intend to expand the eligibility for the scheme for teachers starting work in 2018 only to include:
- 39.1 decile two and three state and state-integrated schools in the Auckland Regional Council boundary, and
  - 39.2 teachers of science, technology, maths, te reo Māori and all teachers in Māori medium settings<sup>2</sup> nationally.
- 40 To address the immediate need of principals to recruit teachers for the 2018 school year and to preserve the advantage the decile one schools currently have from the scheme, this expansion will be limited to the first payment only (\$10,500). I expect eligible teachers to apply for payments in 2021.

### *Covering the cost of the Teacher Education Refresh*

- 41 The Education Council, which sets the standards for teacher registration and certification, requires teachers to undertake the TER programme if they have held a provisional certificate for six years or more, or have not taught for six years since completing an ITE qualification.
- 42 Teachers have repeatedly raised concerns that the time and cost involved in the TER is a barrier to re-entering the profession. This particularly impacts teachers who have worked in relieving roles since gaining their registration, who may not have worked enough hours across the year to meet the Council's minimum requirements for certification.
- 43 The Education Council has recently retendered the TER. Through this, they have been able to reduce the costs from up to \$4,000 per teacher to between \$1,790 and \$2,490 per programme place. The Council has also been able to increase the course options for teachers needing to undertake the TER, including establishing an online option.
- 44 In the current period of pressure on teacher numbers, I am still concerned that the cost of the TER may present a barrier to teachers who would otherwise wish to keep teaching. Accordingly, I propose to fully subsidise the cost of the TER for teachers in this situation for the first half of 2018.
- 45 The previous Government set aside funding for two years to support a new induction and mentoring programme in Budget 2017. This programme is aimed at teachers who are approaching the expiry of their provisional certificate, but who have not obtained employment that has enabled them to fulfil the Education Council's induction and mentoring requirements for full certification.
- 46 Uptake of this programme has been lower than anticipated by the Education Council, and I propose that half of the funding previously set aside in financial years 2017/18 and 2018/19 for the induction and mentoring support is now reprioritised to fund the TER subsidy. The remaining funding of \$1m over two years will continue to be available to support induction and mentoring programmes, approved by the Education Council including their proposed pilot to keep experienced teachers in the system as part time mentors, available to enable more new teachers to be supported.

---

<sup>2</sup> Māori medium are settings where the curriculum is delivered in and through te reo Māori more than 51% of the time.

### *Recruitment, Retention and Responsibility (3R) fund*

- 47 Where a school has been unable to employ a registered teacher, they can employ an unregistered teacher who has been granted a LAT. LATs may be used to cover teaching positions in a variety of roles, and enable employers to have access to skills that are in short supply and to enable those with specialist skills, but without a teaching qualification, to teach.
- 48 However, people teaching on a LAT are only able to be paid in accordance with the untrained teacher salaries as set out in the relative collectives. For people with relevant industry experience in some areas, such as technology, this represents a reduction in their income.
- 49 The 3R allowances are additional payments that School Boards can provide to teachers, including those on a LAT, to increase their salaries. Primary sector payments are \$2,750 per annum, while secondary sector payments \$4,000 per annum. Boards can allocate multiple allowances to one teachers. As with management units, there is an expectation that the Board will have a policy on the allocation of 3R payments which it has consulted on with its staff.
- 50 Schools fund 3R allowances out of their operational grant or their own locally raised funds. However, some schools find it difficult to afford these allowances. I am proposing to set aside \$1m in a fund available in financial year 2017/18. State and state-integrated schools will be able to apply to this fund when they have been unable to recruit a suitable registered teacher, and cannot recruit a person on a LAT without offering a 3R allowance. Schools will have to demonstrate that they cannot afford the proposed 3R allowance out of their own operating grant or locally raised funds.
- 51 In addition, under its emergency staff vacancy policy, where a school has an emergency staff vacancy and no suitable applicants are available, Te Kura may approve dual tuition as an emergency measure. This option is not well promulgated and many School Boards may not be aware of the opportunity that this presents. The Ministry and Te Kura will work together to ensure that School Boards are aware of the opportunity that the emergency staff vacancy policy presents for schools unable to recruit teachers.

### *Improvements to overseas recruitment processes*

- 52 In addition, the Ministry of Education, the Education Council and the NZQA, along with Immigration New Zealand, have developed a set of pre-approved teaching qualifications and fast-track process for these qualifications.
- 53 This change will mean that overseas teachers with these qualifications from the United Kingdom, Ireland, Canada and Fiji will complete the NZQA process at no cost, with both qualification and teacher registration processes completed within 10 days. I will announce this fast-track process as part of this package.
- 54 Some Auckland principals have raised a concern that current immigration policy settings, particularly in relation to the points system, work against Auckland schools being able to hire teachers from overseas. I propose that the Minister of Immigration and I instruct the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment to look into these concerns, and to investigate possible options to address these concerns. Officials would be expected to report to Ministers with this advice by June 2018.

### *Implementing targeted social media and marketing campaigns and online employment support*

- 55 Good marketing campaigns are an effective tool to attract New Zealanders into teaching, and to attract capable overseas teachers to come and teach here. I will fund a highly targeted campaign to support the initiatives in this package focusing on graduating teachers and lapsed teachers with direct communications about getting into or returning to teaching, the vacancies available, including where to find them, and the support available.
- 56 I have instructed the Ministry to communicate directly with recent ITE graduates and teachers with lapsed registrations before Christmas to engage them in seeking employment as teachers for 2018.

## Ongoing work programme to address supply pressure

- 57 I expect that the package set out in this paper to support the retention of graduate teachers in the profession and re-entry into teaching of trained and registered teachers whose registration has lapsed.
- 58 Initiatives in this paper focus on the immediate supply pressures. I will be considering whether other initiatives are needed to support the workforce strategy that the Ministry of Education is developing.
- 59 In addition, I have asked the Ministry to explore options for better supporting the transition of graduating teachers through to full certification, to fulfil another of our manifesto commitments. This will include looking into the support provided for schools to employ and support graduate teachers through to full certification.
- 60 One of our biggest communication tools to promote teaching as an attractive and rewarding career is the way that the teaching profession is positioned by political leaders and Government officials, but also principals and sector groups. In some contexts the narrative about teaching may be having a negative effect on the status of the profession. We are keen to work with the whole sector to promote a more positive picture about teaching as a career.
- 61 The sector working group established by the Secretary for Education to focus on Quality Teaching and Wellbeing will serve as a vehicle for strengthening the conversation about the value and importance of the teaching profession.

## Consultation

- 62 The States Services Commission, Te Puni Kōkiri, the Ministry of Social Development and the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet have been consulted.
- 63 The Treasury and the Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment have also been consulted and provide the following comment:
- 63.1 “While we do acknowledge that there is an issue with teacher supply, particularly in some regions and in some subject areas, the Treasury and the Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment note that there is a lack of robust data as to the scale of the issue. We note that the Ministry of Education is currently working on a workforce strategy which is intended to take a longer-term view of the needs and direction of the workforce, including addressing some of the information gaps across the system. As part of this work, the Ministry should consider how to increase flexibility to respond to teacher supply issues in particular regions and subject areas”.

## Financial Implications

- 64 The following table details the cost of the initiatives proposed in this paper:

Initiative (\$m)	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22& outyears
Expand 2018 cohort of the Beginning Teacher Project by 20 places	0.480	-	-	-	-
Subsidise the cost of the TER	1.250	-	-	-	-
Recruitment and marketing campaign	1.000	-	-	-	-
Increase the 2019 cohort of Teach First NZ by 35	-	0.559	0.929	0.546	-
Expansion of the VBS - \$10,500 only and in specified settings	-	-	-	3.736	-
3R fund	1.000	-	-	-	-
<b>Total Costs</b>	<b>3.730</b>	<b>0.559</b>	<b>0.929</b>	<b>4.282</b>	<b>-</b>

65 To fund this package, I have identified three areas of expenditure to be reprioritised. They are in Vote Education, Vote Social Development, and Vote Tertiary Education:

Reprioritisation options (\$m)	\$m – increase/(decrease)				
	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
Lower National Study award costs	(2.000)	(2.000)	-	-	-
One off reduction in TeachNZ Scholarships	(3.000)	-	-	-	-
Savings within postgraduate ITE programmes <sup>3</sup> (pending OBU approval)	(1.500)	-	-	-	-
Low demand for Induction and Mentoring Programme	(0.500)	(0.500)	-	-	-
<b>Total Savings</b>	<b>(7.000)</b>	<b>(2.500)</b>	-	-	-

66 Savings are forecast from National Study Awards where current funding allows for the maximum costs of each award, however there has been a trend of lower expenditure of between \$2.7m and \$3.5m over the last three years. There would be no reduction in the National Study Awards available.

67 One off savings are available related to TeachNZ Scholarships, Exemplary Postgraduate ITE programmes and the Induction and Mentoring Programme where there is lower demand for these scholarships and programmes. At this stage out year savings are not expected.

68 Savings across these initiatives bring some financial risk, for example the cost of National Study Award could be higher in out years. I propose that Cabinet delegates authority to the Minister of Finance and Minister of Education (and, as appropriate, the Minister of Social Development) jointly to approve adjustments to appropriations where there is higher than expected expenditure where savings are proposed.

69 The Ministry estimates that it will cost \$0.3m per annum to administer and evaluate this package, and will seek opportunities to fund this from within baseline.

### Human Rights

70 This proposal is consistent with the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990 and the Human Rights Act 1993.

### Legislative Implications

71 This proposal does not have legislative implications.

### Gender Implications

72 This proposal does not have gender implications.

### Disability Perspective

73 This proposal does not have disability implications.

### Publicity

74 I intend to announce details of the comprehensive teacher supply package at the appropriate time in 2017, with the Ministry of Education providing further details of the package as appropriate.

75 I also intend to release this paper and associated advice online at the appropriate time, subject to any redactions that would be justified if the information had been requested under the Official Information Act 1982.

<sup>3</sup> The post-graduate exemplary ITE programmes are funded from the Quality Teaching Agenda which was a Vote Education initiative, funded in Budget 13.



## Recommendations

- 76 The Minister of Education recommends that the Committee:
- 1 **note** that there is pressure on current teacher supply in some areas, including Auckland, and some subjects, including te reo Māori and Māori medium, and science, technology and mathematics
  - 2 **note** that there are several factors driving current teacher supply pressure, including:
    - 2.1 increasing roll growth in the primary sector which will begin moving into the secondary sector from 2019
    - 2.2 falling enrolments in initial teacher education and longstanding concerns on the quality of initial teacher education programmes
    - 2.3 low retention rates of beginning teachers not employed in permanent roles
  - 3 **note** that the Ministry of Education is in the early stage of developing an overarching workforce strategy that will underpin advice on the education workforce and will report back to Cabinet in due course
  - 4 **note** that I have developed a package of initiatives to address immediate teacher supply pressures for which I am seeking funding now in order to announce this package before Christmas
  - 5 **agree** to expand the Beginning Teacher Project by an additional 20 places to a total of 60 places in 2018
  - 6 **agree** to subsidise the Teacher Education Refresh for the first half of 2018
  - 7 **agree** to fund a time limited and highly targeted social media and marketing campaign aligned with the initiatives in this package
  - 8 **agree** to expand the employment-based initial teacher education programme Teach First NZ by 35 places to a total of 80 places in 2019
  - 9 **agree** to expand eligibility to the Voluntary Bonding Scheme for 2018 only to:
    - 9.1 graduate teachers in decile two and three state and state-integrated schools in the Auckland Regional Council boundary area for the first payment (\$10,500) only
    - 9.2 graduate teachers in Māori medium settings and secondary teachers of science, technology, mathematics and te reo Māori nationally for the first payment (\$10,500) only
  - 10 **note** that teachers will need to work in an eligible school continuously for three years in order to be eligible for a Voluntary Bonding Scheme payment
  - 11 **agree** to establish a fund of \$1m for 2018 to support schools use of recruitment, retention and responsibility (3R) allowances when employing a person on a Limited Authority to Teach as they have been unable to recruit a registered teacher
  - 12 **note** that the Ministry, Education Council, NZQA, and Immigration New Zealand have developed a set of pre-approved qualifications and fast-track process for these qualifications, meaning that teachers with these qualifications from the United Kingdom, Ireland, Canada, and Fiji will be able to complete the NZQA qualification process within 10 days and at no cost
  - 13 **note** that the Minister of Education and the Minister of Immigration will direct the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment to assess whether

there are excessive barriers overseas teachers being approved to work in New Zealand and, if so, how these could be addressed

- 14 **note** that officials will report to Ministers with this advice by June 2018
- 15 **approve** the following fiscally neutral adjustment to give effect to the policy decisions in this paper, with no impact on the operating balance:

	\$m – increase/(decrease)				2021/22 & Outyears
	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	
<b>Vote Education</b>					
<b>Minister of Education</b>					
Departmental Output Expense: Support and Resources for Education Providers (funded by revenue Crown)	1.000	-	-	-	
Benefits or Related Expenses: National Study Awards	(2.000)	(2.000)	-	-	-
Teacher Trainee Scholarships	-	0.175	-	3.736	-
Non-Departmental Other Expenses: Primary Education	0.730	(0.250)	-	-	-
Secondary Education	0.250	0.134	0.929	0.546	-
Multi-Category Expenses and Capital Expenditure Improved Quality Teaching and Learning MCA					
Non-Departmental Output Expense: Professional Development and Support	1.250	-	-	-	-
<b>Total Operating Vote Education</b>	<b>1.230</b>	<b>(1.941)</b>	<b>0.929</b>	<b>4.282</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Vote Tertiary Education</b>					
<b>Minister of Education</b>					
Non-Departmental Output Expense: Tertiary Sector / Industry Collaboration Projects	(1.500)	-	-	-	-
<b>Vote Social Development</b>					
<b>Minister for Social Development</b>					
Benefit or Related Expense: Study Scholarships and Awards	(3.000)	-	-	-	-
<b>Total Operating</b>	<b>(3.270)</b>	<b>(1.941)</b>	<b>0.929</b>	<b>4.282</b>	<b>-</b>

- 16 **agree** that the proposed changes to appropriations for 2017/18 above be included in the 2017/18 Supplementary Estimates and that, in the interim, the increases be met from Imprest Supply
- 17 **note** that consistent with its Budget Responsibility Rules, the Government will ensure that it is delivering a sustainable operating surplus across an economic cycle and reducing the level of net core Crown debt to 20% of GDP within the next five years

- 18 **agree** to delegate authority to the Minister of Finance and the Minister of Education to make adjustments (and, as appropriate, the Minister of Social Development) jointly to make adjustments to appropriations where demand is different to what is forecast currently in recommendations 5-11
- 19 **note** that the Minister of Education will release this paper and associated advice at the appropriate time, subject to any redactions that would be justified if the information had been requested under the Official Information Act 1982

Authorised for lodgement  
Hon Chris Hipkins  
Minister of Education